

The Foremuslims deny his Traditions

People denied and disapproved the excessiveness of Abu Hurayra in narrating traditions at his time. He exceeded all the limits and had a peculiar style that made people doubt him and doubt his traditions. They denied the quantity and the quality of his traditions and blamed him frankly.

He himself said: “People say that Abu Hurayra tells too many of traditions. Allah (S.w.T.) is the judge in the hereafter. They say that why the Muhajireen and the Ansar don’t tell like what he tells...”

He confessed that both the quantity and the quality of his traditions were subject to denying, therefore he threatened them painfully where he said: “Allah (S.w.T.) is the judge in the hereafter.” He showed at the end of this tradition that unless he was obliged according to his legal duties, he would never tell of anything at all for they doubted him. He said: “I swear by Allah (S.w.T.) that unless these two verses:

(Surely those who conceal the clear proofs and the guidance that We revealed after We made it clear in the Book for men, these it is whom Allah (S.w.T.) shall curse, and those who curse shall curse them (too) Except those who repent and amend and make manifest (the truth), these it is to whom I turn (mercifully); and I am the Oft-returning (to mercy), the Merciful)¹

were in the Qur’an, I would never tell you of anything at all.”² It was clear to prove what we said.

Another clearer one narrated by Abu Razeen³ that he said: “Abu Hurayra came out to us, beat his front with his hand and said: “You say that Abu Hurayra ascribes lies to the Prophet (S.) so that you will be guided and I will go astray.”

When he came to Iraq with Mu’awiya and saw the big crowd, who came to meet him, he knelt on his knees and began to beat his baldhead to draw their attention. When they gathered around him, he said: “O people of Iraq, do you pretend that I ascribe lies to the Prophet (S.) to burn myself in Hell?...and he began to abuse Imam ‘Ali (a.s.) to flatter the Umayyads.⁴

What sufficed this concern that those, who denied his traditions and criticized him, were of the great companions. Ahmed Ameen said⁵ about Abu Hurayra: “The companions often criticized him for his excessiveness in narrating prophetic traditions and doubted him (to be a liar) according to what Muslim

mentioned in his Sahih.” Then he mentioned two traditions from Muslim’s Sahih showing Muslim’s criticism and doubt in Abu Hurayra.

Mustafa Sadiq ar-Rafi’ei said in this concern: “The most in narrating traditions among the companions was Abu Hurayra. His companionship with the Prophet (S.) was three years only, therefore Omar, Othman, Ali and Aa’isha denied his traditions and doubted him. He was the first narrator in the history of Islam to be doubted (accused of fabricating). Aa’isha was the most extreme of those, who denied his traditions.”⁶

An-Nazzam said: “Omar, Othman, Ali and Aa’isha considered Abu Hurayra as liar.”⁷

Ibn Qutayba said:⁸ “An-Nazzam criticized Abu Hurayra by being accused of lying by Omar, Othman, Ali and Aa’isha that Abu Hurayra had accompanied the Prophet (S.) for three years only but he narrated from him so many traditions, which were more than what had been narrated by any of the first and previous companions, who doubted him and denied his excessiveness.⁹ They said: “How did you alone hear all of that? Who heard it with you?” Aa’isha was the most extreme in denying his traditions for she remained alive for a long time, where Abu Hurayra told of his traditions. Omar also was very extreme against the excessive narrators or those, who told of legal verdicts without any evidence...to the end of his saying, which confirmed what an-Nazzam had said. He did so forcedly and in spite of him for rightness always spoke justly and obstinately!

As for what ibn Qutayba¹⁰ pretended that: “the companions gave in when Abu Hurayra told them about his special rank near the Prophet (S.)”, it was nonsense and vain. The great companions knew him well and did not need any one to introduce him to them. If they had a bit of respect towards him, they would never accuse him and consider him as liar. You noticed his saying¹¹ that he fell to the ground faintly (during the reign of the Prophet (S.)) between the minbar and the room. The comers put their feet on his neck thinking that he was mad. Did that fit respect and honor?

In brief: it was certain that all the great veracious companions doubted him and denied his sayings. But when they went to the better world and those, who came after them, decided that the companions all in all were just and fair and they forbade criticizing them. They made that as legal verdict of the Shari’ah and hence they imprisoned the minds, gouged out the eyes, put porches on the hearts and deafen the ears. People became

(Deaf, dumb (and) blind, so they will not turn back) 2:18.

Glory be to the infallible imams where they put the companions in their suitable places, which they themselves had already been in.¹² So their thought about Abu Hurayra was not different from the thought of Ali, Omar, Othman and Aa’isha. The Shias, since the age of Imam ‘Ali (a.s.) until nowadays, kept to the same way of their imams.

All of the Mu’tazilites might have the same point of view. Imam Abu Ja’far al-Iskafi said:¹³ “Abu Hurayra

was infected in his mind according to our sheikhs. His traditions were disapproved by them. Once Omar beat him and said to him: “You exceeded in your traditions. You might be a liar ascribing lies to the Prophet (S.).” Sufyan ath-Thawri narrated a tradition from Mansoor that Ibrahim at-Taymi had said: “They didn’t depend upon Abu Hurayra’s traditions except those traditions, which were about Paradise and Hell.”

Abu Ossama narrated a tradition that al-A’mash had said: “Ibrahim was trusty in narrating tradition. I used to show him whatever I heard of traditions. One day I brought him some traditions narrated by Abu Salih from Abu Hurayra. He said to me: “Let me away from Abu Hurayra! They left many of his traditions aside.” It was mentioned that Imam ‘Ali (a.s.) had said: “The most untruthful one (or he said of the alive), who ascribes lies to the Prophet (S.), is Abu Hurayra ad-Doussi.” Abu Yousuf mentioned that he had said to Abu Haneefa: “Some prophetic traditions that reach us, contradict our analogy. What do we do with them?” He said: “If they were narrated by trusty people, we would depend upon them and leave our points of view aside.” I said: “What do you say about Abu Bakr and Omar?” He said: “They were trusty.” I said: “Ali and Othman?” He said: “So were they.” When he saw me mentioning the companions, he said: “All of the companions were fair and trusty except some ones.” He mentioned some, among them were Abu Hurayra and Anass bin Malik.

Imam Abu Haneefa and his companions left Abu Hurayra’s tradition aside if it would contradict their analogy as they did with his tradition about the (missrat).¹⁴ Abu Hurayra narrated that the Prophet (S.) had said: “Don’t confine milk in your sheep or camels’ udders. He, who buys them, will have the choice after he milks them either to keep them if he accepts or return them to their keeper with a certain measure (about three kilos) of dates.” They didn’t pay any attention to this tradition and said: “Abu Hurayra was not a jurisprudent and his tradition contradicted our analogy completely. Milking the animal was to be considered as trespassing the other’s right, which must be compensated with the like or the value, but that measure of dates would not be one of them.¹⁵

We knew that Abu Haneefa and his companions thought that the prayer would be invalid by any kind of speech, which was not a part of the prayer whether by forgetting, unknowing or thinking that the prayer was finished. The Hanafite jurisprudence was clear about this matter. So was the thought of Sufyan ath-Thawri. Hence the tradition of Abu Hurayra had no value among them, when he said that once the Prophet (S.) had forgotten and ended the prayer after two ruk’as instead of four then he left his oratory and entered his room. When he came back, it was said to him: “Did you lessen the prayer or did you forget?” He said: “The prayer wasn’t lessened and I didn’t forget.” They said: “Yes, you did.” And after an argument between him and them, he believed them and completed his prayer with two other ruk’as. Then he offered the prostrate of the forgetting. According to this tradition, Malik, ash-Shafi’ei, Ahmed and al-Awza’ei gave a fatwa that talking (some speech that was not a part of the prayer) by someone, who forgot that he had been offering the prayer or he thought that he had ended the prayer, would not invalidate it. But Abu Hanifa, who didn’t pay any attention to Abu Hurayra’s tradition, said that talking during the prayer would make it invalid.¹⁶

Let us conclude this chapter with some events happened between Abu Hurayra and some of the companions showing you how they regarded him.

Abu Hurayra said: “When my tradition was mentioned to Omar, he called for me and said: “Were you with us that day when we were in the house of that (man)?” I said: “Yes, I was, when the Prophet (S.) said: “Whoever ascribed to me an untrue tradition, his place would definitely be in Hell.”¹⁷

This proved that he neither told of traditions in the presence of Omar, nor he was one of those, whom Omar saw and heard narrating traditions. In fact Omar had heard his tradition from the people and he accused him of lying. He called for him and warned him from Hell if he would lie.

One day Omar rebuked him by saying:¹⁸ “Either you leave narrating traditions or I will expel you to the land of Douss¹⁹ or the land of monkeys.”

One day Omar became very angry with him for his excessiveness in narrating prophetic traditions. He beat him with his stick and rebuked him by saying: “You exceeded with your traditions and I think you ascribed false traditions to the Prophet (S.).”

Omar deposed him from the emirate of Bahrain after he had beaten him until he wounded him. He got back from him ten thousand dinars to the treasury. He rebuked him with terrible words.

During the reign of the Prophet (S.), Omar beat him until he fell on his back to the ground.²⁰

When Imam ‘Ali (a.s.) had heard Abu Hurayra’s traditions, he said: “The most lying of people, (or he said) of the alive people about the Prophet (S.) is Abu Hurayra ad-Doussi.”

Abu Hurayra often said: “My intimate told me” “I saw my intimate” “My intimate, the Prophet (S.), said to me”. Ali heard of that. He said to Abu Hurayra: “When was the Prophet (S.) your intimate, Abu Hurayra?” Imam ‘Ali (a.s.) denied Abu Hurayra’s saying because he distrusted him.²¹ Ali (a.s.) definitely was right for he (is with the Qur’an and the Qur’an is with Ali. They won’t separate until they come to the Prophet’s (S.) pond in the Day of Resurrection).²² Ali is with the rightness and the rightness is with Ali. It turns with him however he turns.²³

Aa’isha called for Abu Hurayra after she had heard his traditions. She said to him: “What were those traditions, which we heard that you told of about the Prophet (S.)? Did you hear other than what we heard or did you see other than what we saw?” He said: “Mother, the mirror and the kohl made you busy away from the prophet.”²⁴

Abu Hurayra narrated a tradition saying that woman, dog and donkey²⁵ invalidate the prayer. Aa’isha denied that and said: “I saw the Prophet (S.) offering the prayer while I was cross between him and the kiblah.”

He narrated a tradition that the Prophet (S.) had forbidden to walk with one shoe. When Aa’isha heard that, she walked with one shoe and said that she would contradict Abu Hurayra.

He narrated that: “Whoever was impure when it dawned, he was not to fast.” When Aa’isha and Hafsa²⁶

denied that, he unsaid his saying and excused that he hadn't heard it from the Prophet (S.), but he had heard it from al-Fadhli bin al-Abbas, who was dead then.²⁷

Once two men came to Aa'isha and said: "Abu Hurayra narrated that the Prophet (S.) had said: "Evil omen is but in women and sumpters." Aa'isha became very excited and said: "I swear by Him, Who revealed the Qur'an to Abul Qassim (Muhammad) that he, who told of this tradition, was a liar."²⁸

One day he sat beside the room of Aa'isha narrating traditions about the Prophet (S.). She was busy glorifying Allah (S.w.T.). When she finished, she said: "How wonder it is! Abu Hurayra sits beside my room ascribing traditions to the Prophet (S.) and making me hear that. I was busy glorifying Allah (S.w.T.). If I got him, I would refute his traditions."²⁹

He narrated that the Prophet (S.) had said: "Whenever one of you wakes up from sleep, let him wash his hands. He doesn't know where his hands were in the night." Aa'isha denied that³⁰ and said: "How do we do with the (mihra)ss³¹?"

He narrated that the Prophet (S.) had said: "Whoever carries a coffin, has to do wudu'." Ibn Abbas denied it and said: "Carrying dry pieces of wood doesn't require wudu'."³²

Abdullah bin Omar narrated a tradition saying: "The Prophet (S.) ordered to kill the dogs except the hunting-dogs and the cattle-dogs." They said to ibn Omar that Abu Hurayra had added the farm-dogs. He didn't care for that and said: "Abu Hurayra has a farm." He accused him of adding the farm-dog to the Prophet's (S.) tradition in order to keep his dog and farm.³³

Abu Hurayra narrated that the Prophet (S.) had said: "Whoever keeps a dog other than a hunting-dog, a cattle-dog or a farm-dog, Allah (S.w.T.) will take off one carat a day from his merits." When they mentioned Abu Hurayra's saying to ibn Omar, he said: "May Allah (S.w.T.) have mercy upon Abu Hurayra. He had a farm." He accused him of adding that to the tradition for the sake of his benefit. Salim bin Abdullah bin Omar accused him of that, too, in a tradition mentioned by Muslim.³⁴

Ibn Omar didn't believe Abu Hurayra's tradition of the hedgehog and he still doubted about it.

When ibn Omar heard Abu Hurayra narrating: "Whoever followed a funeral, would have a carat of merit", he didn't believe him and said that Abu Hurayra had exceeded with his traditions. He sent someone to Aa'isha asking her about it. When she confirmed the tradition, then he believed it.³⁵

When Aamir bin Shurayh bin Hani heard Abu Hurayra narrating: "Whoever likes to meet Allah (S.w.T.), Allah (S.w.T.) likes meeting him and whoever hates to meet Allah (S.w.T.), Allah (S.w.T.) hates meeting him", he didn't believe him until he asked Aa'isha. She narrated it and explained it to him.³⁶

If we mentioned all the cases, in which the companions had denied Abu Hurayra's traditions and refuted them, we would waste our time, but that would suffice to prove what we wanted to say.

It was enough that Omar, Othman, Ali and Aa'isha denied his traditions and refuted them. It was decided

by the Islamic jurisprudence to prefer criticising (a companion) to justifying (what he was accused of) when there was an opposition. But in this case there was no opposition at all because passion alone did not oppose the denying of those great people.

As to regard the companions all in all as truthful and fair, there was no evidence proving that. The companions themselves knew nothing about that. If we supposed so, it would be applied to the unknown ones and not to whom Omar, Othman, Ali and Aa'isha considered as liar and having many defects, which was confirmed by many evidences.

We, followers of the twelve Imams (a.s.), have a moderate thought about the companions, which we explained in details in our book (Answers of Musa JarAllah (S.w.T.)). Whoever wants to know about that, let refer to it.

His Protest Against His Accusers

Abu Hurayra protested against those, who accused him of excessiveness in narrating traditions by saying:³⁷ “They say that Abu Hurayra narrates too much many traditions! Allah (S.w.T.) is our judge in the Day of Resurrection! They say why the Muhajireen and the Ansar do not narrate (prophetic traditions) so much as he does. My brothers of the Muhajireen were busy dealing in the markets and my brothers of the Ansar were busy managing their gardens (of date-palms), while I was a poor man keeping to the Prophet (S.) for feed. So I was attendant when they were absent and I perceived where they forgot.”

Once the Prophet (S.) said:“ If one of you spreads his dress until I finish my speech then he joins it to his chest, he will never forget anything of my sayings at all. I spread my garment, which I had no cloths on me other than; until the Prophet (S.) finished his speech then I joined it to my chest. I swear by Him, who had sent his Prophet (S.) with the rightness, that I never forgot anything of his sayings until this day. By Allah (S.w.T.), if it was not for these two verses in the Qur'an, I would have never narrated anything.

(Surely those who conceal the clear proofs and the guidance that We revealed after We made it clear in the Book for men, these it is whom Allah shall curse, and those who curse shall curse them (too) Except those who repent and amend and make manifest (the truth), these it is to whom I turn (mercifully); and I am the Oft-returning (to mercy), the Merciful)³⁸

As Abu Hurayra got wealthier, he became more foolish.³⁹ He wanted to convince his accusers, who accused him of the quantity and the quality of his traditions, so he said this tradition to defend himself and to protest against them, but what a trivial protest he made! In fact he, unknowingly, gave his opponents evidence against himself, which proved that what they ascribed to him was true. I swear by the honor of truthfulness and the highness of the veracious that I have not seen among all what the fabricators did, a tradition farther away from the truth than this one. I wouldn't mention it or talk about it, unless the two sheikhs and their likes mentioned it in their (Sahihs) happily and worshipingly to their thought about the companions. They contradicted by that the rational and traditional evidences and

contradicted the thoughts of the great first Muslims.⁴⁰ We have some notes about the invalidity of this tradition:

Firstly: Abu Hurayra pretended that the Muhajireen were away from the Prophet (S.) because they were busy dealing in the markets and the Ansar were busy managing their gardens. He drove all the first Muslims of Muhajireen and Ansar with one stick. Was there any value for his saying that all the Muhajireen were busy of dealings in the markets after the saying of Allah (S.w.T.): ***(Men whom neither merchandise nor selling diverts from the remembrance of Allah (S.w.T.))***⁴¹?

Did what contradicted the holy Qur'an deserve but to be thrown off? And who was Abu Hurayra to be attendant while the close companions of the Prophet (S.) were away from him? And that he memorized while they forgot? He said that full-mouthedly without shame or fear for he said that at the time of Mu'awiya, where there were no Omar, Othman, Ali, Talha, az-Zubayar, Salman, Ammar, al-Miqdade, Abu Zarr, or the likes. ***(A grievous word it is that comes out of their mouths; they speak nothing but a lie)***.⁴²

How far his word was from the truth! All people knew the position of Ali to the Prophet (S.), the close relationship and the special respect. He put him in his lap when he was a child, embraced him to his chest, his pure flesh touched his flesh, chewed the bite and put it in his mouth. He never found a lie in a saying of his nor a fault in a deed of his. Allah (S.w.T.) had joined the Prophet (S.) with the greatest of His angels that took him into the ways of nobilities and highest morals of the world. Ali followed the Prophet (S.) as a young weaned camel following his mother.

The Prophet (S.) raised for Ali a banner of morals every day. He ordered Ali to follow his lead. Ali was with the Prophet (S.) (and the great Khadija, the Prophet's (S.) wife) in the cave of Harra' seeing the light of Gabriel and his mission and smelling the fragrance of the prophecy. After that he became the gate of the Prophet's (S.) town of knowledge, the best judge of the umma, the keeper of the Prophet's (S.) secrets, his guardian, the heir to his rule, the dispeller of his grief, the bearer of an attentive ear who had the knowledge of the Book. After all that, did Ali (a.s.) forget of the Sunna what Abu Hurayra had kept, or did he keep a secret what Abu Hurayra announced?

(Glory be to Thee! this is a great calumny) 24:16.

In fact, just a few of the Muhajireen were busy dealing in the markets. Why didn't those, who had nothing to do with trade or dealing like Abu Zarr, al-Miqdad, Ammar, and the seventy of Abu Hurayra's companions in the suffa, who didn't have cloths to cover their naked bodies except a piece of cloth tied around their necks...as he himself described them, narrated so much many traditions like him? In fact all of their traditions together were less than his.

So were the Ansar. Not all of them had gardens and properties as Abu Hurayra claimed. One of those, who did not have any property, was Salman al-Farisi, whom the Prophet (S.) had said about: "Salman is one of us, the family of the Prophet (S.)."⁴³ He also said: "If religion was on the Pleiades, Salman would

get it.” Aa’isha said –from allstee’ab–: “Salman had evening meetings with the Prophet (S.) that he sat with him alone more than we did.”

Ali said: “Salman al-Farisi is like the sage Luqman. He has known the knowledge of the first ages and the coming ages. He is a sea of knowledge that won’t drain off.” Ka’bul Ahbar said: “Salman is filled up with knowledge and wisdom.” This was besides other virtues mentioned about him. People knew well that Abu Ayyoub al-Ansari lived in subsistence that nothing took him away from knowledge and worship. So were Abu Sa’eed al-Khudary, Abu Fudhala al-Ansari and the other great jurists of the Ansar.

The Prophet (S.) did not spend his time in disorder and confusion. He arranged his times, day and night, according to the tasks required at that time. He definitely specified a certain time for lecturing and teaching the Muslims about their religion and life, which would never contradict their times of work and labor or dealing in the markets. The Muhajireen and the Ansar adhered to these honored meeting of the Prophet (S.) and were more careful of knowing and learning than what the dotards raved.

Secondly: if what Abu Hurayra pretended that the Prophet (S.) had said to his companions: “If any one of you spreads his dress until I finish my speech and then joins it to his chest, he will never forget anything of my saying at all” was true, all the companions would contend to do that. They would obtain a great virtue without striving and gain the eternal knowledge without spending money. So what frustrated them to win that and what prevented them to spread their dresses for that? How would they lose this great opportunity? Were they so trivial to renounce what the Prophet (S.) invited them for? Certainly not! They were his sincere companions, who strove to obey him whatever he said.

Thirdly: if what Abu Hurayra had said was true, the companions would extremely regret what they lost of that great virtue and copious knowledge. Their great sorrow about what they missed by not spreading their dresses in front of the Prophet (S.), which was without any cost or tire, would spread among people and be mentioned in the books and that they would blame each other about their bad choice in leaving that important thing. At least they would envy Abu Hurayra, who had one dress only where they put on two or three, to win that virtue alone. There was nothing of that at all. Abu Hurayra had taken out this tradition from his own bag.

Fourthly: if what Abu Hurayra had told of was true, it would be narrated by the other companions, whom the Prophet (S.) had invited for that. In fact, if it was so, the companions would consider it as one of the signs of the prophecy and as evidence of the religion. It would be famous like the sun in the midday, so why only Abu Hurayra tells this when no one else told of it!

Fifthly: there were differences between his traditions about this story. One time he said as narrated by al-A’raj:44 “One day the Prophet (S.) said to his companions: “If any one of you spreads his dress until I finish my speech and then he gathers it to his chest, he will never forget anything of my speech.” I spread my garment, which I had no dress on me other than, until the Prophet (S.) finished his speech. I gathered it to my chest. I swear by Him, who had sent the Prophet (S.) with the rightness, that I never

forgot anything of that saying of the Prophet (S.).”

Another time he said, as narrated by al-Maqbari:⁴⁵ “I said: “O messenger of Allah (S.w.T.), I sometimes forget what I hear from you.” He said: “Spread your dress!” He ladled with his hands (knowledge and put into the dress) then he said: “Gather it to your chest.” I did. I did never forget anything after that at all.”

You see that the story according to the first tradition narrated by al-A’raj was between the Prophet (S.) and his companions and that it was the Prophet (S.), who invited them to spread their dresses fearing for them from forgetting, whereas, according to the second tradition narrated by al-Maqbari, it was just between Abu Hurayra and the Prophet (S.) and that Abu Hurayra asked the Prophet (S.)

The first tradition, which was narrated by al-A’raj, showed that (not forgetting) concerned the Prophet’s (S.) speech in that certain time only for he said (**that** saying of the Prophet (S.)), whereas in the second tradition narrated by al-Maqbari, he generalized. That was to say he would not forget anything at all. He said: “I did never forget anything after that at all.” Those, who explained these traditions became confused and didn’t know how to justify that until ibn Hajar decided in his book that this case happened two times;⁴⁶ one time **not forgetting** concerned that certain saying of the Prophet (S.) and the other time **not forgetting** concerned the all, whether the previous or the following sayings of the Prophet (S.).⁴⁷

Muslim mentioned⁴⁸ it in a third way narrated by Yunus from ibnul Musayyab that Abu Hurayra had said: “...I never forgot, after that day, whatever the Prophet (S.) told me of.” This tradition was more general than al-A’raj’s tradition and more adequate than al-Maqbari’s.

Ibn Sa’d in his Tabaqat⁴⁹ mentioned a tradition narrated by Amr bin Mardas bin Abdur Rahman al-Jundi that Abu Hurayra had said: “The Prophet (S.) asked me to spread my dress. I did. He told me all the day. Then I gathered my dress to my abdomen. I didn’t forget anything of what he had told me of.” His saying **all the day** was not mentioned in the other traditions except in this one narrated by al-Jundi.

Abu Ya’la mentioned it narrated by Abu Salama in a way different from all the ways of this tradition. He narrated that Abu Hurayra had gone to visit the Prophet (S.) when he was ill. He greeted the Prophet (S.), while the Prophet (S.) was leaning on Ali’s chest and Ali’s hand was on the Prophet’s (S.) chest embracing him and the Prophet’s (S.) legs were extended. The Prophet (S.) said: “O Abu Hurayra, approach to me.” He approached. Then the Prophet (S.) said to him: “Approach to me.” He approached.

Then he said to him: “Approach to me.” He approached until his fingers touched the Prophet’s (S.) fingers. The Prophet (S.) asked him to sit down. He sat down. The Prophet (S.) said to him: “Approach the end of your dress to me.” Abu Hurayra spread his dress and approached it to the Prophet (S.). The Prophet (S.) said to him: “O Abu Hurayra, I recommend you of some practices that you are not to leave as long as you live; you are to bathe in the morning of every Friday (Friday Ghusl), not to talk nonsense, not to play vainly, to fast three days of every month because it equals fasting the age, and the Fajr prayer, don’t leave it even if you pray all the night because it is full of merits.” He said that thrice. Then

the Prophet (S.) asked him to gather his dress to himself. He gathered his dress to his chest.⁵⁰

Abu Ya'la mentioned a tradition narrated by al-Waleed bin Jamee' that Abu Hurayra had said: "I complained to the Prophet (S.) my weak memorization. He said to me: "Open your garment." I opened it. Then he said: "Join it to your chest." I did. After that I did never forget any tradition."

Abu Ya'la mentioned a tradition narrated by Yunus bin Obayd from al-Hasan al-Basri that Abu Hurayra had said: "The Prophet (S.) said: "Who will take from me a word, two or three and wrap them with his dress to learn them and teach them to the others?" I spread my dress in front of him while he was talking then I gathered it. I hope that I did not forget a word of what he had said.

Ahmed mentioned a tradition, somehow like that, narrated by al-Mubarak bin Fudhala from Abu Hurayra.

Abu Na'eem mentioned⁵¹ a tradition narrated by Abdullah bin Abu Yahya from Sa'eed bin Abi Hind from Abu Hurayra that the Prophet (S.) had said to him: "O Abu Hurayra, you don't ask me about the booties, which your friends ask me about!" I said: "I ask you to teach me from what Allah (S.w.T.) has taught you." I took off my garment and spread it between him and me. The lice were creeping on it. He told me until I perceived his speech. He said to me: "Join it to you." After that I didn't forget a letter from what he had told me of."

Whoever inspected this tradition in his different ways of narration would find it different in words and meanings. Its words or meanings were different and they contradicted each other for certainly it was vain. Thanks to Allah (S.w.T.) for that.

Sixthly: he said: "I spread my garment, which I had no dress on me other than." This showed that his private parts would appear. Al-Qastalani and Zakariyya al-Ansari interpreted his saying in order to find an excuse for him. They said that he had spread some of his garment in order that his private parts not to be seen.

Seventhly: this story sounds like the fables. Glory be to Allah (S.w.T.)! He would not let this raving be mixed with the miracles of the Prophet (S.). No one of the rational and wise people would believe this nonsense. The miracles of the Prophet (S.) dazzled the brilliant and defeated the tyrants by the good method and moderate way of them (the miracles).

The Prophet (S.) patted on Ali's chest and said, when he sent him to Yemen as judge⁵²: "O Allah (S.w.T.), guide his heart and direct his tongue." Ali said: "I swear by Allah (S.w.T.) that I never doubted in any judgment (I made) between any two persons after that."

When the Qur'anic verse

(So that We may make it a reminder to you, and that the heeding ear might retain it)⁵³

was revealed to the Prophet (S.), he said addressing Ali: "I asked Allah (S.w.T.) to make it your ear."⁵⁴

Ali said: “I didn’t forget anything after that though I hadn’t forgotten before that.”

The Prophet (S.) said⁵⁵ in the day of (the battle of) Khaybar when he gave the banner to Ali: “O Allah (S.w.T.), save him from hot and cold.” Ali said: “After that I didn’t suffer hot or cold.” He put on light cloths in the winter and heavy cloths in the summer to prove and draw attention always to the Prophet’s (S.) miracle.

When Jabir complained to the Prophet (S.) that his father was in debt, the Prophet (S.) went with him to his threshing-floor. He walked around the heap of the fruits and prayed Allah (S.w.T.) and invoked His blessing. He sat near it. The creditors came and took their debts from that heap. What remained from the heap sufficed Jabir and his family? When the Prophet (S.) wanted to do someone a favour, he prayed Allah (S.w.T.) for him and when he wanted to hurt someone (who deserved that), he prayed to Allah (S.w.T.) against him as he did with Mu’awiya. He said: “Let Allah (S.w.T.) not satiate his stomach!” So did he with al-Hakam bin Abul Aass. But no one dared to say that the Prophet (S.) did something of what Abu Hurayra told of. Because his wisdom, which lighted the way for the deviate sights and paved it with the signs of guidance, was far above that

1. Qur’an, 2:159–160.

2. Mentioned by al-Bukhari and Muslim in their Sahihs. We will mention it with comments in the next chapter inshAllah (S.w.T.).

3. Muslim’s Sahih, vol.2, chapter of clothing, section on using right foot first in wearing shoes, pg.217.

4. Refer to an-Nahj al-Hameedi by Abu Ja’far al-Iskafi, vol. 1, pg.359.

5. In his book Fajrul Islam (Dawn of Islam), pg.262.

6. Refer to his book Adab al-Arab, vol. 1, pg.282.

7. Refer to Ta’weel Mukhtalif al-Hadith by ibn Qutayba, pg.27.

8. Ta’weel Mukhtalif al-Hadith, pg.48.

9. Ibn Qutayba wanted to refute an-Nazzam, but unknowingly he confirmed his saying and added to the list of deniers all the first companions

10. in his book Ta’weel Mukhtalif al-Hadith, pg.50.

11. At the beginnings of this book.

12. Ahmed Ameen said in his book Fajrul Islam, pg.259: “It seemed that the companions themselves criticized each other and preferred one to the other at their time. If someone narrated a tradition, he would be asked for the evidence. Once Abu Hurayra narrated a tradition, which ibn Abbas denied and he narrated another tradition that Aa’isha denied. Fatima bint Qays narrated a tradition from her husband that Omar denied and said: “Do we leave our God’s book and our Prophet’s Sunna for a woman’s saying? We don’t know if it is true or false, she memorizes or forgets! Aa’isha also denied it and said to Fatima: “Don’t you fear Allah (S.w.T.).” There were many cases of the like.

13. Sharh an-Nahj al-Hameedi, vol. 1, pg.360.

14. A cow, a ewe or a she-camel that was not milked for some days to let the milk remain in the udders in order to deceive the buyer that it gave a lot of milk.

15. Refer to Fajr al-Islam by Ahmed Ameen, pg.263.

16. Refer to an-Nawawi’s Sharh Sahih Muslim, vol.4, pg.234.

17. it was mentioned by Musaddad in his Musnad and by ibn Hajar in his Issaba.

18. Refer to Kanzul Ommal by Ibn Asakir, tradition 4885, vol.5, pg.239.

19. The birthplace of Abu Hurayra.

20. Muslim's Sahih, vol. 1, pg.34.
21. Ibn Qutayba said that in his book Ta'weel Mukhtalif al-Hadith, pg.52.
22. Mentioned by al-Hakim in his Mustadrak, at-Tabari in his Awsat and by ibn Asakir in his Kanzul Ommal, vol.6, pg. 153.
23. Refer to Kanzul Ommal, vol.6, pg.157.
24. Refer to al-Hakim's Mustadrak, vol. 3, pg.509 and ath-Thahabi's Talkheess al-Mustadrak. Of course Aa'isha refused his excuse.
25. If they were in front of someone during offering the prayer (according to Abu Hurayra).
26. It was so mentioned in Ta'weel Mukhtalif al-Hadith, but it was Aa'isha and Um Salama, who denied this tradition.
27. These three traditions (about woman, dog and donkey, walking in one shoe and this one) were mentioned in Ta'weel Mukhtalif al-Hadith by ibn Qutayba, pg.27-.
28. Ta'weel Mukhtalif al-Hadith, pg. 126.
29. Refer to Muslim's Sahih, vol.2 section on virtues of Abu Hurayra, pg.358.
30. Refer to Fajrul Islam by Ahmed Ameen, pg.259. Aa'isha denied his tradition because she didn't trust him but her excuse about the (mihraas) was not logical.
31. A big hollow rock was filled with water for wash. It was very heavy.
32. It was mentioned by Ahmed Ameen in his book Fajrul Islam, pg.259.
33. Refer to Muslim's Sahih, vol. 1 section on killing dogs, pg.625.
34. in his Sahih, vol. 1, pg.626.
35. Muslim's Sahih, vol. 1, pg.349-. Al-Hakim in his Mustadrak, vol.3, pg.510 mentioned something like that.
36. Muslim's Sahih, vol.2 section on whoever likes to meet Allah (S.w.T.) (S.w.T.) Allah (S.w.T.) (S.w.T.) likes to meet him, pg.422.
37. It was mentioned by al-Bukhari in his Sahih, vol.2 chapter of Wikaala, section on what was mentioned in planting, pg.34; Muslim in his Sahih, vol.2 of Ahmed's Musnad, and all of those collected Hadith.
38. Qur'an, 2: 159-160.
39. A proverb.
40. Refer to our book Tuhfatul Muhadditheen.
41. Qur'an, 24:37.
42. Qur'an, 18:5.
43. Biography of Salam alFarisi in allstee'ab
44. Refer to al-Bukhari's Sahih, vol.2 chapter of Wikaala, section on what was mentioned in planting, pg.34 and Muslim's Sahih, vol.2 section on Abu Hurayra's virtues, pg.357. Al-Bukhari mentioned in his Sahih, vol.2, pg.1 a tradition narrated by Sa'eed bin al-Musayyab from Abu Salama that Abu Hurayra had said: "The prophet said in one of his traditions: "No one of you will spread his dress until I finish this speech and then to join it to his chest, unless he perceives all what I say." I spread a garment I had on me until he finished his speech. Then I gathered it to my chest. I never forgot anything of that speech."
45. Al-Maqbari is Saed bin Abi Saed. Refer to al-Bukhari's Sahih, vol. 1 chapter of knowledge, section on memorizing knowledge, pg.24.
46. Refer to Irshad as-Sari by al-Qastalani, vol. 1, pg.380.
47. If this case happened one time rather than two or more, it would spread like the light. So why did the companions take no notice of it that no one of them narrated it except Abu Hurayra?
48. In his Sahih, vol.2 section on Abu Hurayra's virtues, pg.258.
49. vol.4, pg.56 (Abu Hurayra's biography).
50. Refer to ibn Hajar's Issaba, (Abu Hurayra's biography).
51. In his book Hilyatul Awliya', pg.381 (Biography of Abu Hurayra).
52. Ali's (a.s.) biography in al-Isteeab.
53. Qur'an, 69:12.
54. It was mentioned by az-Zamakhshari in his Kashshaf, ath-Thalabi in his Tafseer, ar-Razi and others.
55. It was mentioned by Ahmed bin Hanbal in his Musnad, ibn Abu Shayba and ibn Jareer. Refer to Muntakhab Kanzul

Source URL:

<https://www.al-islam.org/abu-hurayra-abdul-hussayn-sharafiddeen-al-musawi/foremuslims-deny-his-traditions>