

# Fabricated Traditions



**Sayyid Ali al-Husayni al-Milani**

**Translated by  
Dr. Sayyid Abdur Rauf Afzali**

**Al-Islam.org**

Fabricated Traditions: A Critical Assessment of Traditions on Classification of Caliphs and their Excellences

**Author(s):**

Sayyid Ali al-Husayni al-Milani [3]

The author discusses traditions about caliphs relating their names in order; he proves that such traditions are fabricated and forged by studying various chains of these kinds of traditions available in Sihah al-Sitta and other credible Sunni sources.

**Translator(s):**

Dr. Sayyid Abdur Rauf Afzali [4]

**Category:**

Sunni & Shi'a [5]

Early Islamic History [6]

Hadith Collections [7]

**Topic Tags:**

Caliphate [8]

Fabricated Traditions [9]

**Miscellaneous information:**

Fabricated Traditions: A Critical Assessment of Traditions on Classification of Caliphs and their Excellences Ayatollah Sayyid Ali Husaini Milani Translated by: Dr. Sayyid Abdur Rauf Afzali Islamic Truths Center A Series of Theological Studies [www.al-milani.com](http://www.al-milani.com)

**Featured Category:**

Debates & discussions [10]

Resources for Further Research [11]

Responses to Misconceptions [12]

**Person Tags:**

Umar b. al-Khattab [13]

Abu Bakr [14]

Uthman [15]

Imam Ali [16]

***In the Name of Allah the Beneficent the Merciful***

With the prophetic mission of Prophet Muhammad (S), the seal of the prophets, the last and the most perfect divine religion was conveyed to humanity and prophethood came to an end.

The religion of Islam emerged in Mecca but after twenty three years of arduous efforts made by the Messenger Allah (S) and a handful of his loyal companions it spread all over the Arabian Peninsula.

The continuation of this divine mission was a task that was entrusted publicly on Dhul Hijja, the eighteenth, by Allah, the Glorious, to Ali (a.s), the commander of the faithful and the first personality after the Holy Prophet (a) in the world of Islam.

With the proclamation of Hazrat Ali's guardianship and succession on this day, divine blessings were completed and the religion of Islam was perfected, being announced as the only religion chosen by Allah. That was how unbelievers and pagans got disappointed from destroying Islam.

Soon after [the demise of the Messenger of Allah (S)], some of the companions of the Holy Prophet (S) based on their pre-hatched conspiracies, brought deviation in the course of guidance and leadership. They closed the gate of the city of knowledge putting Muslims in perplexity. From the very beginning of their rule, they placed the truths of Islam – that were like shining sun – behind the dark clouds of doubt and skepticism by putting a ban on recording prophetic traditions , spreading fabricated traditions , casting doubts and using hypocrisy and deception.

Obviously, in spite of all conspiracies hatched by the enemies of Islam, the truths of Islam and noble sayings of the Messenger of Allah (S) were promulgated by the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.), his successors and a few of his devout companions and those truths kept flowing and manifesting themselves in one way or the other in the course of history. By explaining the truths, they did away with the doubts, hesitation, illusions, and unfounded beliefs inculcated by the enemies of Islam, making truths clear to all.

In this respect, great scholars and men of knowledge such as Sheikh Mufid, Sayyid Murtadha, Khaja Nasir, Allamah Hilli, Qadhi Nurullah, Mir Hamid Husain, Sayyid Sharafuddin, Allamah Amini etc. are like shining stars for they are the ones who defended Islamic truths, explained the realities of the school of Ahlulbayt (a.s.) and dealt with spurious arguments using their tongues and pens.

In our era, one of the of the scholars and researchers who has, with his eloquent pen and expressive writing, explained the truths of the religion of Islam and astutely defended the leadership and wilayah (guardianship) of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.) is Ayatollah Sayyid Ali Husaini Milani.

The Islamic Truths Center is proud to embark on reviving the fruitful and precious works of that great

researcher by reviewing, translating and publishing them in a bid to make them available to students, scientific figures and those who are in search for Islamic truths.

The book in your hand is a translation of one of his works, intended to acquaint the English audience with Islamic truths. It is expected that this humble effort will earn the pleasure of the Remnant of Allah, the Imam of Time [the twelfth Shiite Imam] may Allah hasten his reappearance.

## **Islamic Truths Center**

### ***In the name of Allah, the Beneficent, the Merciful***

All praise is due to Allah, the Lord of the worlds and may prayer and peace be upon our master and Prophet, Muhammad, and his pure progeny, and may Allah's curse be upon all their enemies from the first to the last one.

In one of my studies, commenting on a tradition, I mentioned that all traditions that are about caliphs, relating their names in order are no doubt fabricated and forged.

Some thoughtful readers asked me to prove it through studying various chains of this kind of traditions available in *sihah sitta* or other credible works.

It was because of this that I began to write the book in your hand. While carrying out the research, I found out that not only the traditions in the section related to the virtues of caliphs but all such traditions found in any sections are fabricated and fake even the traditions that contain such phrases: the Holy Prophet (S) said: Abu Bakr, Umar, Uthman and I came .... Abu Bakr, Umar, Uthman and I went out ... Where are Abu Bakr, Umar and Uthman?....

Some of these traditions contain the name of Ali (a.s) as well, placing it sometimes before the name of Uthman. The names of Abu Bkr and Umar however always precede the name of Imam Ali (a.s) in these traditions.

More interestingly I found a tradition in which the liars narrate such things from Imam Ali (a.s), commander of the faithful, to show that he himself accepted the virtues of caliphs and thus no one could reject it!

As an instance look at the tradition narrated by Bukhari and Muslim via two channels. Bukhari says: Walid bin Salih narrated from Isa bin Yunus from Umar bin Sa'eed bin Abi al-Husain Makki from Ibn Abi Malika from Ibn Abbas .... Whereas Muslim says: Sa'eed bin Amr Ash'athi, Abu al-Rabi'a Atki and Abu Karib Muhammad bin Alla (this phrase belongs to Abu Karib) 1narrated from Ibn Mubarak from Amr bin Sa'eed bin Abi Husain, from Ibn Malika from Ibn Abbas:

When Umar bin Khattab's corpse was placed in coffin, people gathered around it. Before the coffin was moved, people were praying for Umar and telling his virtues. I was also there among them. All of a sudden a man grabbed my shoulder from behind. I turned back and saw that it was Ali (a.s). He was also asking forgiveness for Umar and addressing him, he said: "You did not leave anyone behind so that we could wish to meet Allah through his deeds. I hope Allah will help you to join the two comrades (the Holy Prophet (S)<sup>2</sup> and Abu Bakr). This is because I frequently heard the Holy Prophet (S) say: I came along with Abu Bakr and Umar, I entered along with Abu Bakr and Umar and got out along with Abu Bakr and Umar. Thus I hope Allah will help you to join them.<sup>3</sup>

In addition to Bukhari and Muslim, it is Ibn Majah who has narrated this tradition from Umar bin Sa'eed from Ibn Abi Malika from Ibn Abbas.

It has to be however said that this tradition is absolutely fake and Imam Ali (a.s), commander of the faithful never said such things. This is because Ibn Malika who is the axis of the reporters of this tradition is among the foes of Imam Ali (a.s) and Ahl al-Bayt. He was the judge and mu'zzin (one who calls for prayer) of Abdullah bin Zubair.<sup>4</sup>

It has to be mentioned here that we appeal to this kind of traditions only to silence our opponents.

We ask Allah to help us do our deeds only for Him and assist us to find out the truth and act in accordance with it. Allah is kind and benevolent.

### **Sayyid Ali Husaini Milani**

1. – It is worth mentioning that Abu Rabi'a uses the phrase 'narrated to us' whereas the other two reporters have made use of the phrase 'told us'.
2. – The letter 's' stands for 'peace be upon him and his progeny'. Though the Sunnite sources suffice to saying 'peace be upon him' after mentioning the name of the Prophet (S), omitting 'and his progeny', we have intended to mention the whole version of this supplication, whenever we have used the abbreviation 's'.
3. – Sahih Bukhari, vol. 3, p. 1345. (Book of the virtues of the companions of the Holy Prophet (S)), tradition no. 3274. Sahih Muslim, vol. 5, p. 12 (Book of the virtues of the companions of the Holy Prophet (S)), tradition no. 2389.
4. – Tahzib al-Tahzib, vol. 5, p. 272.

Sunni scholars narrate traditions from the Holy Prophet (S) which talk about the virtues and excellences of the caliphs. We will now deal with fourteen traditions, studying them carefully and critically. The first tradition is taken from *Sahih Bukhari*.

In his *Sahih*, Bukhari narrates from Abu al-Hasan Muhammad bin Miskin, from Yahya bin Hisan from Sulayman from Sharik bin Abi Namr from Sa'eed bin Musayyib who quotes Abu Musa 'Ash'ari as saying:

One day, I performed ablution in my house and then went out and said, "Today I shall stick to Allah's Apostle and stay with him all this day of mine (in his service)." I went to the mosque and asked about the

Prophet (S). They said, "He got out of the mosque and went in this direction." So I followed his way, asking about him till he entered a place called Bir Aris. I sat at its gate that was made of date-palm leaves till the Prophet finished answering the call of nature and performed ablution. Then I went up to him to see him sitting at the well of Aris at the middle of its edge with his legs uncovered, hanging in the well. I greeted him and went back and sat at the gate. I said, "Today I will be the gatekeeper of the Prophet (S)." After a short while, Abu Bakr came and pushed the gate. I asked, "Who is it?" He said, "Abu Bakr." I told him to wait, went in and said, "O Allah's Apostle! Abu Bakr asks for permission to enter." He said, "Admit him and give him the glad tidings that he will be in Paradise." So I went out and said to Abu Bakr, "Come in, and Allah's Apostle gives you the glad tidings that you will be in Paradise"

Abu Bakr entered and sat on the right side of Allah's Apostle on the built edge of the well and hung his legs in the well as the Prophet did and uncovered his legs. I then returned and sat (at the gate). I had left my brother performing ablution and he intended to follow me. So I said (to myself). "If Allah wants good for so-and-so (i.e. my brother) He will bring him here." Suddenly somebody moved the door. I asked, "Who is it?" He said, "Umar bin Al-Khattab." I asked him to wait, went to Allah's Apostle, greeted him and said, 'Umar bin Al-Khattab asks the permission to enter." He said, "Admit him, and give him the glad tidings that he will be in Paradise." I went to "Umar and said "Come in, and Allah's Apostle, gives you the glad tidings that you will be in Paradise." So he entered and sat beside Allah's Apostle on the built edge of the well on the left side and hung his legs in the well. I returned and sat (at the gate) and said, (to myself), "If Allah wants good for so-and-so, He will bring him here." Somebody came and moved the door. I asked "Who is it?" He replied, "Uthman bin Affan." I asked him to wait and went to the Prophet and informed him.

He said, "Admit him, and give him the glad tidings of entering Paradise, I asked him to wait and went to the Prophet and informed him. He said, "Admit him and give him the glad tidings of entering Paradise after a calamity that will befall him." So I went up to him and said to him, "Come in; Allah's Apostle gives you the glad tidings of entering Paradise after a calamity that will befall you." Uthman then came in and found that the built edge of the well was occupied, so he sat opposite to the Prophet on the other side. Said bin Al-Musaiyab said, "I interpret this (narration) in terms of the location of their graves." <sup>1</sup>

Muslim Nayshaburi has also narrated this tradition using the same wordings and chain of transmitters. <sup>2</sup>

Bukhari has also narrated this tradition through another chain from Yusuf bin Musa from Abu Usama from Uthman bin Ghiyath from Abu Uthman Nahdi from Abu Musa. <sup>3</sup>

Muslim has similarly narrated this tradition using another chain. He narrates from Muhammad bin Muthanna Itri from Ibn Abi Udai from Uthman bin Ghiyath from Abu Uthman Nahdi from Abu Musa 'Ash'ari. <sup>4</sup>

In addition to Bukhari and Muslim, others have also narrated this tradition.

## Transmitters tradition

We will now assess the lives of the narrators of this fabricated tradition.

### Sharik bin Abi Namr

One of the narrators in the chain of this tradition is Sharik bin Abi Namr. Though Ibn Mu'aeen has confirmed him, terming his traditions as acceptable other scholars of tradition have rejected him. For example Nisae (and even Ibn Mu'aeen elsewhere) have said that Sharik is not strong in terms of narrating traditions. Speaking about him, Ibn Udai says that if a reliable narrator narrates from him then he is a reliable narrator. Yahya bin Sa'eed, one of the narrators of this tradition, does not narrate from him. Commenting on him, Saji says that Sharik believes in fatalism (a remark that shows that he was an adherent of a false religion). Ibn Hazm has considered him as weak due to narrating Mi'araj tradition. After narrating this tradition, Zahabi says that this tradition is among the strange traditions narrated by Bukhari.<sup>5</sup>

### Uthman bin Ghiyath

Uthman bin Ghiyath is one of the narrators of the second chain. Scholars of traditions have considered him as weak. Quoting Ibn Mu'aeen Dawri says that Yahya bin Sa'eed has regarded his commentary traditions as weak. Ali bin Madini quotes Yahya (namely Qattan) as saying that Uthman bin Ghiyath has access to books compiled by 'Akrama, which are not authentic. Ajuri quotes Abu Dawood as having said that he is a member of Basran Murji'a.<sup>6</sup> Ahmad says that he is a proponent of Murji'a school of thought.<sup>7</sup>

### Abu Usama

It is worth mentioning that Bukhari has narrated this tradition from Uthman bin Ghiyath who has narrated it from Abu Usama (Hammad bin Usama). This narrator has also been criticized. Quoting Mu'aeeti, Azdi says that he usually resorted to deception, though he abandoned this habit later. Commenting on him, Ibn Sa'eed says that he resorts to deception and his deception is plain. Concerning him, Sufyan Thawri is quoted as having said that he is perplexed as to how Usama's traditions are accepted whereas he is well-known for his excelling others in stealing good traditions. Ajuri narrates from Abu Dawood, from Waki'a who said that Abu Usama had buried his books and that was the reason why he prevented him from borrowing book.<sup>8</sup>

1. – Sahih Bukhari, vol. 3, pp. 1343 and 1344, Tradition no. 3471. Elsewhere in Sahih Bukhari the same tradition has appeared with a somewhat different wording. See for example the following:

a) The Prophet entered a garden and ordered me to guard its gate. A man came and asked permission to enter. The Prophet said, "Admit him and give him the glad tidings of entering Paradise." Behold! It was Abu Bakr. Another man came and asked the permission to enter. The Prophet said, "Admit him and give him the glad tidings of entering Paradise." Behold! It was 'Umar. Then another man came, asking the permission to enter. The Prophet kept silent for a short while and then said, "Admit him and give him the glad tidings of entering Paradise with a calamity which will befall him." Behold! It was

'Uthman bin 'Affan. 'Asim, in another narration, said that the Prophet was sitting in a place where there was water, and he was uncovering both his knees or his knee, and when 'Uthman entered, he covered them (or it).

b) While I was with the Prophet in one of the gardens of Medina, a man came and asked me to open the gate. The Prophet said to me, "Open the gate for him and give him the glad tidings that he will enter Paradise." I opened (the gate) for him, and behold! It was Abu Bakr. I informed him of the glad tidings the Prophet had said, and he praised Allah. Then another man came and asked me to open the gate. The Prophet said to me "Open (the gate) and give him the glad tidings of entering Paradise." I opened (the gate) for him, and behold! It was 'Umar. I informed him of what the Prophet had said, and he praised Allah. Then another man came and asked me to open the gate. The Prophet said to me. "Open (the gate) for him and inform him of the glad tidings, of entering Paradise with a calamity which will befall him. "Behold ! It was 'Uthman, I informed him of what Allah's Apostle had said. He praised Allah and said, "I seek Allah's aid."

2. – Sahih Muslim, vol. 5, pp. 20 and 21, tradition no. 2403.

3. – Sahih Bukhari, vol. 3, pp. 1350 and 1351, tradition no. 3490.

4. – Sahih Muslim, vol. 5, pp. 19 and 20, tradition no. 2403. His version of this tradition is not the same either. See for example the following:

a) Abu Musa Ash'ari reported that he performed ablution in his house and then came out saying: I would remain with Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) the whole day long. He came to the mosque, and asked about Allah's Apostle (may peace be upon him). They (his Companions) said: He has gone in this direction. He (Abu Musa Ash'ari) said: I followed his steps asking about him until I came to Bi'r Aris (it is a well in the suburb of Medina). I sat by its wooden door until Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) had relieved himself and then performed ablution. I went to him and he was sitting with his shanks uncovered up to the knees and his legs dangling in that well.

I offered him salutations. I then came back and sat at the door as if I had been a chamberlain at the door of Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) that day. There came Abu Bakr and knocked the door and I said: Who is it? He said: This is Abu Bakr. I said: Wait, please. I went and said: Allah's Messenger, here is Abu Bakr seeking permission. Thereupon he said: Admit him and give him glad tidings of Paradise. I came and I said to Abu Bakr to get in (and also told him) that Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) was giving him the glad tidings of Paradise. Abu Bakr got in and sat on the right side of Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) and dangled his feet in the well as Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) had done, and he uncovered his shanks.

I then returned and sat there and I had left my brother as he had been performing ablution and he was to meet me and I said: If Allah would intend goodness for such and such he would intend goodness for his brother and He would bring him. I was thinking this that a person stirred the door. I said: Who is it. He said: This is Umar b., Khattab. I said: Wait. Then I came to Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him), greeted him and said: Here is 'Umar seeking your permission to get in. Thereupon he said: Let him come in and give him glad tidings of Paradise.

I came to Umar and said: There is permission for you and glad tidings for you from Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) for Paradise. He got in and sat on the left side of Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) with his feet dangling in the well. I then returned and sat and said: If Allah would intend goodness for such and such (that is for his brother), He would bring him. And I was contemplating over it that a man stirred the door and I said: Who is it? He said: This is Uthman b. Affan.

I said: Wait, please. I then came to Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) and informed him. and he said: Admit him and give him glad tidings (and inform) him of the turmoil which he shall have to face. I came and said: Get in, Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) gives you the glad tidings of Paradise along with the trial which you shall have to face. He got in and saw the elevated plan round the well fully occupied. He sat on the other side. Sharik said that Sa'id b. al-Musayyib reported: I drew a conclusion from it that their graves would be (in this very state, the graves of Hadrat Abu Bakr, 'Umar Faruq by the side of the Holy Prophet [may peace be upon him] and the grave of Hadrat 'Uthman away from their graves).



Abu Musa. reported: I set out with the intention (of meeting) Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) and came to know that he had gone to the gardens (in the suburb of Medina). I followed him and found him in a garden sitting upon an elevated place round the well with his shanks uncovered which had been dangling in the well. The rest of the hadith is the same but with this variation that there is no mention of the words of Sa'id: all drew a conclusion from it pertaining to their graves."(Sahih Muslim, tradition no, 5911).

b) Abu Musa al-Ash'ari reported that while Allaah's Messenger (sallAllaahu alayhi wa sallam) was in one of the gardens of Medina, reclining against a pillow and fixing a stick in a mud, that a person came asking for the gate to be opened, whereupon he said: Open it for him and give him glad tidings of Paradise and, lo, it was Abu Bakr. I opened (the gate) for him and gave him the glad tidings of Paradise.

Then another person asked for the door to be opened, whereupon he said: Open it and give him the glad tidings of Paradise. He said: I went away and, lo, it was 'Umar. I opened it for him and gave him the glad tidings of Paradise. Then still another man asked for the door to be opened, and thereupon Allaah's Prophet (sallAllaahu alayhi wa sallam) said: Open it and give him the glad tidings of Paradise after a trial would afflict him. I went and, lo, it was 'Uthman b. 'Affan. I opened the door and gave him the glad tidings of Paradise and informed him (what the Prophet had said). Thereupon he said: O Allaah, grant me steadfastness. Allaah is one Whose help is to be sought.(Sahih Muslim tradition, no. 5909).

5. – Mizan al-Itidal, vol. 3, p. 372 and Tahdib al-Tahdib, vol. 4, p. 308.

6. – Murji'a was a group of Muslims who believed that committing a sin is not harmful as long as one is faithful.

7. – Tahdib al-Tahdib, vol. 7, pp. 129–130. Mizan al-Itidal, vol. 5, p. 65.

8. – Mizan al-Itidal, vol. 2, p. 357 and Tahdib al-Tahdib, vol. 3, p. 4.

We narrate the second fabricated tradition from Muslim Nayshaburi. In his *Sahih*, Muslim narrates the following:

Abd al-Malik bin Shuayb bin Laith bin Sa'eed narrates from his father, from his grandfather from Aqil bin Khalid from Ibn Shahab from Yahya bin Sa'eed bin 'As from Sa'eed bin 'As who quote Aisha, wife of the Holy Prophet (S) and Uthman as saying:

Abu Bakr sought permission from Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) for entrance (in his apartment) as he had been lying on his bed covered with the bed-sheet of A'isha, and he gave permission to Abu Bakr in that very state and he, having his need fulfilled, went back. Then Umar sought permission and it was given to him in that very state and, after having his need fulfilled, he went back. And 'Uthman reported: Then I sought permission from him and he got up and said to A'isha: Wrap yourself well with your cloth, then I got my need fulfilled and came back. And A'isha said: Allah's Messenger, why is it that I did not see you feeling any anxiety in case of dressing properly in the presence of Abu Bakr and 'Umar (Allah be pleased with them) as you showed in case of 'Uthman. Thereupon Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) said: Verily Uthman is a person who is very modest and I was afraid that if I permitted him to enter in this very state he would not inform me of his need.<sup>1</sup>

## Transmitters of Tradition

We need to evaluate the transmitters of this fabricated tradition. The scholars of the science of rijal hold varied opinions concerning them.

### 'Aqil bin Khalid

One of the transmitters this chain includes is 'Aqil bin Khalid. Although Abu Hatam, commenting on him, says that he though not a memorizer of tradition was author of a book and was truthful. Majishun describes him as a policeman. Zahabi says that he was a stupid governor (of one of the Syrian cities). Yahya Qattan regarded 'Aqil as weak in terms of transmitting traditions.<sup>2</sup>

### Zuhri

Among others, this chain includes the name of Zuhri. He was among the most well-known figures who was deviated from the straight path of Imam Ali (a.s), commander of the faithful and the Holy Prophet's progeny (a.s) and was thus fabricating traditions with the aim of underrating them and overrating their opponents.

Commenting on this regard, Ibn Abi al-Hadid says: Zuhri was among those figures who were deviated from the straight path of Imam Ali (a.s) and the Holy Prophet's family (a.s). Jarir bin Abd al-Majid quotes Muhammad bin Shaiba as saying: One day I went to the mosque of Medina. I saw that Zuhri and Urwa bin Zubair were sitting there talking ill of Ali (a.s).

Ali bin al-Husain learnt about it and thus he walked towards them. When he reached them he said: O Urwa! My father complained against your father before Allah and Allah passed a judgment in favor of my father against your

father. As far you Zuhri! If I were in Macca I would have shown you the position of your father.

Ibn Abi al-Hadid adds: 'Asim bin Abu 'Amir Bajli narrates from Urawa's son that Yahya bin Urwa said: Whenever my father mentioned the name of Ali he would talk ill of him.<sup>3</sup>

Speaking about Zuhri, Ibn Abd al-Barr says: In his Jami'a, Mu'ammarr, quoting Zahri, says: Zaid bin Haritha is the first one who embraced Islam. Abd al-Razzaq says that no one other than Zuhri has made such a claim.<sup>4</sup>

The word mentioned above implies that Zuhri has told a lie, because it was Imam Ali (a.s) who was the first to embrace Islam whereas Zuhri wanted to refute this virtue.

Moreover, Zuhri's hostility towards the Holy Prophet's progeny was so intense that he did not hesitate to narrate from Umar bin Sa'ad bin Abi Waqqas! Speaking in this regard, Zahabi says: Umar bin Sa'ad bin

Abi Waqqas, quoting his father and Ibrahim and Abu Ishaq quoting Umar Sa'ad, say that Zuhri and Qutada narrate from Umar Sa'ad in 'mursal' format.

Ibn Mu'aen exclaims saying how the killer of Imam Husain could be a credible person.<sup>5</sup>

It has to be said that Zuhri is among the supporters and secret agents of Ummayyid rule. Commenting on him in his *Rijal al-Mishkat*, Sheikh Muhadith, Abd al-Haq Dihlawi says: Because of accompanying rulers, Zuhri had a weak faith. Scholars and pious people close to him were critical of him, pinpointing to him the risks of accompanying rulers.

In response, Zuhri would always say that he was sharing their good deeds and was loathing their evil actions.

The scholars and pious people would, in turn, say: Don't you see that they cherish false ideas and do evil deeds?

Ibn Khallakan says that Zuhri went on accompanying Abd al-Malik and his son, Hisham, after his father's death. Yazid bin Abd al-Malik used to make use of him in judiciary matters.<sup>6</sup>

It was because of this that Ibn Mu'aen criticized him. Quoting Ibn Mu'aen, Hakim Nayshaburi says: Best chains are those in which 'Amash narrates from Ibrahim from 'Alqama from Abdullah. Somebody addressing Ibn Mu'aen said that 'Amash is also like Zuhri. Ibn Mu'aen in response said: You regard 'Amash as equal to Zuhri! Zuhri is after worldly gains working for Ummayyids. This is while 'Amash is a forbearing fakir who knows the Holy Quran and keeps distance from rulers.<sup>7</sup>

It was on account of this that Imam Zayn al-'Abidin (a.s) wrote him a letter, admonishing him, reminding him of Allah's [wrath] and the hereafter and telling him about the bad consequences of accompanying rulers and staying in their castles.

God save you and us from seditious matters and guard you against the Fire (of Hell) out of His mercy. You have been enjoying a state due to which it is serving for anyone who knows you to show compassion to you. You have been overburdened with the graces of God Who has given you a good physical health and a long age. Furthermore, He has constituted His claims against you when He charged you with the responsibility of His

Book, made you understand His religion, introduced to you the traditions of His Prophet Mohammed (peace be upon him and his family). He has also imposed upon you a responsibility in every favor that He has done to you and every claim that He has instituted against you. He has tested your gratitude in every matter that He has done to you and every grace through which He has shown His favors to you. He says:

If you give thanks, I shall give you greater (favors), but if you show ingratitude, know that My retribution is severe. Consider to which party you will be added when you will (inevitably) stand before God Who

will ask you about His graces; how you acted upon them, and about His claims; how you treated them. Never think that God will accept your unjustifiable excuses or will be satisfied with your negligence. Too far is that! Too far is that! It is definitely not in that manner. God has ordered the scholars (to show people and not to hide any part of it) in His Book when He said:

When God made a covenant with the People of the Book saying: Tell the people about it without hiding any part. **You should know that the least of concealing knowledge and the lightest burden is to entertain the estrangement of an unjust person and pave the way of seduction to him through responding to him when he sought your nearness and called upon you. I am too afraid that** you will acknowledge your sins with the betrayers tomorrow and will be asked about whatever you have gotten due to your supporting the unjust in oppression, since you have taken the gift that was not yours, you have been close to him who did not give back anyone's right, you have not rejected a wrongdoing when he approached you, and you have responded to him who antagonized God. As the unjust ones invited you, they make you the axis of the hand-mill of their wrongdoings, the bridge on which they cross to their misfortunes, and the stairs to their deviation.

You have been the propagandist of their temptation when you took their courses. They have employed you as the means through which they aroused doubts against the scholars and dragged the hearts of the ignorant to them. The best one in their government and the most powerful of them could not achieve success like that which you have attained through showing their corrupt affairs as honest and attracting the attentions of the celebrities as well as the ordinary people to you. If you compare what you have done to them with what they have given to you, you will find it too little. Likewise, they have built for you very trivial things while they ruined your great things. Look in yourself, for no one will look in you except you yourself, and maintain judgment with yourself as if you are the judge. Look into your gratitude to Him Who nourished you with His graces when you were little and when you became old. I am too afraid you will be one of those about whom God says in His Book:

Their descendants who inherited the Book gained (by bribery only) worthless things from the worldly life saying, "We shall be forgiven (for what we have done). You are not living in a permanent abode; you are in a temporary house that you will leave soon. How does a man stay after the departure of his matches? Blessed be those who are fearful of this world. How miserable those who die and leave their sins after them are! Beware; you have been told. Take the initiative; you have been respited. You are

dealing with Him Who is never ignorant. He who counts your deeds is never remiss. Supply yourself (with the necessary provisions); the long journey is approaching you. Correct your guilt; it has been inflicted by a cureless malady.

Do not think that I wanted only to censure, reproach, and dishonor you. I only wanted God to revive the opinions that you have missed and give you back your religious affairs that you have lost. This is because I remembered God's saying: Keep on reminding them. This benefits the believers. You neglected the reference to your old men and friends who passed away while you remained after them

like a hornless sheep. See whether they had suffered what you suffered or faced what you faced. Had they neglected a good-deed that you did or had they been unaware of something that you retained?

The only difference between you and them is that you have occupied a distinctive standing in people's minds that they have been pursuing your opinions and carrying out your orders. They deem lawful anything that you deem lawful and deem unlawful anything that you deem unlawful. You are not fit enough for so. It is, in fact, the departure of their scholars, the prevalence of ignorance upon them and you, the fondness of leadership, and the seeking of the worldly pleasures that they, as well as you, enjoy—these matters made them overcome you through their desire to gain what you have in possession.

Can you not feel the ignorance and deception that you live, while people are indulging into misfortunes and sedition? You have exposed them to misfortunes and tempted them by precluding them from their earnings because of what they have seen from you. Hence, they longed for attaining the level of knowledge that you have attained or obtaining, through it, what you have obtained. They therefore have drowned in a bottomless ocean and an immeasurable misfortune. God give you and us. He is the One Whose help is sought. So then, leave all that in which you are engaged so that you may catch up with the virtuous ones whom were buried with their tatters while their bellies were stuck to their backs. No screen was put between God and them.

The worldly pleasures could not charm them and they paid no attention to them (such pleasures). They longed for (God), sought (Him), and soon caught up (with Him). If this world makes you in such a manner, while you are attaining such an age, enjoying such a deep-rooted knowledge, and being so near of death, how can then a juvenile be saved (against the worldly pleasures), while he is ignorant, weak-minded, and brainless? We are Allah's and to Him we will return.

Upon whom should we depend? Whom should we blame? We should only complain of our grief and what are we suffering to God. We only charge our misfortune about you to God's account. Look into your gratitude to Him Who nourished you with His graces when you were little and when you became old, your magnifying Him Who makes you handsome among people through His religion, your preserving the dress of Him Who covered you up among people through His dress, and your closeness or remoteness from Him Who ordered you to come near and be modest to Him. Why do you not wake up from your slumber, and reform yourself after your

stumble? You should have said: By God I swear, I have not done any act for the sake of God and for stimulating one of the rites of His religion or terminating one of the wrong customs. Do you show gratitude to Him Who settled all your needs in this way?

I am too afraid you are one of those about whom God the Exalted says: (They) neglected their prayers and followed their worldly desires. They will certainly be lost. God has ordered you to carry His Book and deposited His knowledge with you, but you have wasted them both. We thank God Who has saved us

from that with which He has inflicted you. Salaam.8

1. – Sahih Muslim, vol. 5. Pp. 18–19, tradition, no. 2402. Another version of this tradition has also been reported by Muslim in his Sahih. See: A'isha reported: Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) was lying in the bed in my apartment with his thigh or his shank uncovered that Abu Bakr sought permission to get in. It was given to him and he conversed in the same very state (the Prophet's thigh or shank uncovered).

Then 'Umar sought permission for getting in and it was given to him and he conversed in that very state. Then 'Uthman sought permission for getting in; Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) sat down and he set right his clothes. Mubammad (one of the narrators) said: I do not say that it happened on the same day. He ('Uthman) then entered and conversed and as he went out, A'isha said :

Abu Bakr entered and you did not stir and did not observe much care (in arranging your clothes), then 'Umar entered and you did not stir and did not arrange your clothes, then 'Uthman entered and you got up and set your clothes right, thereupon he said: Should I not show modesty to one whom even the Angels show modesty (Sahih Muslim, Book 31, Tradition, Number 5906).

2. – Mizan al-Itidal, vol. 5, p. 111.

3. – Sharh Nahj al-Balagha, vol. 4, p. 102.

4. – Al-Isti'ab, vol. 2, p. 117.

5. – Al-Kashif, vol. 2, p. 301.

6. – Wafiyat al-A'ayan, vol. 4, p. 178.

7. – Tahdib al-Tahdib, vol. 4, p. 204.

8. Tuhaful-Uqul 'an Al al-Rasul, pp. 274 – 277 and Ihya al-Ulum, vol. 2, p. 143.

واعلم أن أدنى ما كتمت وأخف ما احتملت أن آنست وحشة الظالم وسهلت له طريق الغي بدنوك منه حين دنوت وإجابتك له حين دعيت، فما .... – أخوفني أن تكون تبوء بإثمك غدا مع الخونة، وأن تسأل عما أخذت بإعانتك على ظلم الظلمة، إنك أخذت ما ليس لك ممن أعطاك ودنوت ممن لم يرد على أحد حقا ولم ترد باطلا حين أدناك. وأحببت من حاد الله أوليس بدعائه إياك حين دعاك جعلوك قطبا أداروا بك رحي مظالمهم وجسرا يعبرون عليك إلى بلاياهم وسلما إلى ضلالتهم، داعيا إلى غيهم، سالكا سبيلهم، يدخلون بك الشك على العلماء ويقتادون بك قلوب الجهال إليهم، فلم يبلغ أخص وزرائهم ولا أقوى أعوانهم إلا دون ما بلغت من إصلاح فسادهم واختلاف الخاصة والعامة إليهم. فما أقل ما أعطوك في قدر ما أخذوا منك. وما أيسر ما عمروا لك، فكيف ما خربوا عليك. فانظر لنفسك فإنه لا ينظر لها غيرك وحاسبها حساب رجل مسؤول. وانظر كيف شكرك لمن غذاك بنعمه صغيرا وكبيرا. فما أخوفني أن تكون كما قال الله في كتابه: " فخلف من بعدهم خلف ورثوا الكتاب يأخذون عرض هذا الأدنى ويقولون سيغفر لنا " إنك لست في دار مقام. أنت في دار قد آذنت برحيل، فما بقاء المرء بعد قرناته. طوبى لمن كان في الدنيا على وجل، يا بؤس لمن يموت وتبقى ذنوبه من بعده.

احذر فقد نبئت. بادر فقد أجلت. إنك تعامل من لا يجهل. وإن الذي يحفظ عليك لا يغفل. تجهز فقد دنا منك سفر بعيد ودان ذنوبك فقد دخله سقم شديد. ولا تحسب أنني أردت توبيخك وتعنيفك وتعيبك ، لكنني أردت أن ينعش الله ما [قد] فات من رأيك ويرد إليك ما عزب من دينك وذكرتك قول الله تعالى في كتابه: " وذكر فإن الذكرى تنفع المؤمنين ".

أغفلت ذكر من مضى من أسنانك وأقرانك وبقيت بعدهم كقرن أعضب.

أنظر هل ابتلوا بمثل ما ابتليت، أم هل وقعوا في مثل ما وقعت فيه، أم هل تراهم ذكرت خيرا أهملوه (6) وعلمت شيئا جهلوه، بل حظيت (7) بما حل من حالك في صدور العامة وكلفهم بك، إذ صاروا يقتدون برأيك ويعملون بأمرك. إن أحللت أحلوا وإن حرمت حرّموا وليس ذلك عندك ولكن أظهرهم عليك رغبتهم فيما لديك، نهاب علمائهم وغلبة الجهل عليك وعليهم وحب الرئاسة وطلب الدنيا منك ومنهم أما ترى ما أنت فيه من الجهل والغرة وما الناس فيه من البلاء والفتنة، قد ابتليتهم وفتنتهم بالشغل عن مكاسبهم مما رأوا، فتاقت نفوسهم إلى أن يبلغوا من العلم ما بلغت، أو يدركوا به مثل الذي أدركت، فوقعوا منك في بحر لا يدرك عمقه وفي بلاء لا يقدر قدره. فإله لنا ولك وهو المستعان.

أما بعد فأعرض عن كل ما أنت فيه حتى تلحق بالصالحين الذين دفنوا في أسماهم ، لاصقة بطونهم بظهورهم، ليس بينهم وبين الله حجاب ولا تفتتهم الدنيا ولا يفتنون بها، رغبوا فطلبوا فما لبثوا أن لحقوا. فإذا كانت الدنيا

تبلغ من مثلك هذا المبلغ مع كبر سنك ورسوخ علمك وحضور أجليك، فكيف يسلم الحدث في سنه، الجاهل في علمه المأفون في رأيه ، المدخول في عقله. إنا لله وإنا إليه راجعون. على من المعول؟

وعند من المستعجب؟ نشكو إلى الله بثنا وما نرى فيك ونحسب عند الله مصيبتنا بك.

فانظر كيف شكرك لمن غذاك بنعمه صغيرا وكبيرا، وكيف إعظامك لمن جعلك بدينه في الناس جميلا، وكيف صيانتك لكسوة من جعلك بكسوته في الناس ستيرا، وكيف قربك أو بعدك ممن أمرك أن تكون منه قريبا ذليلا. مالك لا تنتبه من نعستك وتستقيل من عزتك فتقول. والله ما قمت له مقاما واحد

أحييت به له دينا أو أمت له فيه باطلا، فهذا شكرك من استحملك. ما أخوفني أن تكون كمن قال الله تعالى في كتابه:  
"أضاعوا الصلاة واتبعوا الشهوات فسوف يلقون غيا" استحملك كتابه واستودعك علمه فأضعته، فنحمد الله الذي عافانا مما ابتلاك به والسلام

The third fabricated tradition is narrated by Muslim in his *Sahih* in a chapter devoted to the excellences of Talha and Zubair. He narrates from Ubaidullah bin Muhammad bn Yazid bin Khanis and Ahmad bin Ysuf bin Azdi from Ismael bin Yunus bin Abu Uwais from Sulayman bin Bilal from Yahya bin Sa'eed from Sahl bin Abu Salih from his father who quotes Abu Huraira as saying:

Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) was on the mountain of Hira' that it stirred; thereupon Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) said: Hira! be calm, for there is none upon you but a Prophet, a Siddiq, a martyr, and there were upon it Allah's Prophet (may peace be upon him), Abu Bakr, 'Umar, Uthman, 'Ali, Talha, Zubair, Sa'd b. Abi Waqqas.<sup>1</sup>

## Evaluation of tradition

Though the tradition mentioned above does not arrange the names of caliphs on the basis of the order of their caliphate, we, however, look at it from two angles: First, the inventor of this tradition has dealt with the issue of the order of the names of caliphs elsewhere in this tradition, using the language of the Holy Prophet (S). Two, in addition, this tradition intends to attribute the adjective 'siddiq' to Abu Bakr and the adjective 'shahid' to all others who follow him. It has to be however mentioned that this tradition is fabricated on two grounds: its text and its chain of transmitters.

### 1. Text of Tradition

This tradition attributes the adjective 'shahid' to the people mentioned above, whereas none of them except Imam Ali (a.s) was martyred. Sa'ad bin Abi Waqqas died in his castle a natural death. That is why in a tradition preceding this tradition in *Sahih Muslim* no mention is made of the name of Sa'ad. This in itself is a thought provoking point! Others have however, complying with the implication of the tradition, said that Sa'ad bin Abi Waqqas died of plague. Whoever dies of plague is a martyr!<sup>2</sup>

### 2. Chain of transmitters of tradition

In assessing the chain of transmitters of this tradition we suffice to looking at Ismael bin Uwais, omitting thus other reporters this chain includes. Scholars of traditions have given varied comments in regard with him.

Nisae says he was weak in terms of transmitting traditions.<sup>3</sup> Yahya bin Mu'aeen accuses Ismael and his father of stealing traditions. Dulabi, commenting on weak narrators, quotes Nadr bin Salama Maruzi as saying that Ismael bin Abu Uwais is a full liar. After quoting this quotation, Zahabi says: Ibn Udai narrated three traditions from Ismael and said: He narrated strange traditions from his maternal uncle

which are not reliable at all.4Ibrahim bin Junaid quotes Yahya as saying: Ismael bin Abu Uwais is a liar. He is not a credible narrator.5

In his *al-Muhalla*, Ibn Hazm quotes Abu al-Fath Azdi as saying: Saif bin Muhammad told me that Ibn Uwais was in fact fabricating traditions.6

Commenting on Ismael, 'Aini says that he himself confessed that he was fabricating traditions. Nisaei has also mentioned the same point, quoting Salma bin Shu'aib.7

1. – Sahih Muslim, vol. 5, p. 33 and 34, tradition no. 2417. Another version of this tradition is also reported by Muslim. See: Abu Huraira reported: Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) was upon the mountain of Hira,' and there were along with him Abu Bakr, Umar, Uthman. 'Ali, Talha, 'Zubair, that the mountain stirred; thereupon Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) said: Be calm, there is none upon you but a Prophet, a Fiddle (the testifier of truth) and a Martyr.(Book 31, Number 5942). Bukhari has also narrated traditions of this kind. See for example:

a) Allah's Apostle ascended the (mountain) of Uhud with Abu Bakr and 'Uthman and it shook. Allah's Apostle said, "Be calm, O Uhud!" I think he stroked it with his foot and added, "There is none on you but a Prophet, a Siddiq and two martyrs." (The two martyrs were Umar and Uthman) (Sahih Bukhari, Vol. 5, Book 57, Number 46).

b) The Prophet once climbed the mountain of Uhud with Abu Bakr, 'Umar and 'Uthman. The mountain shook with them. The Prophet said (to the mountain), "Be firm, O Uhud! For on you there are no more than a Prophet, a Siddiq and two martyrs. (Sahih Bukhari, Vol. 5, Book 57, Number 24)

c) The Prophet ascended the mountain of Uhud and he was accompanied by Abu Bakr, 'Umar and 'Uthman. The mountain shook beneath them. The Prophet hit it with his foot and said, "O Uhud ! Be firm, for on you there is none but a Prophet, a Siddiq and a martyr. (Vol. 5, Book 57, Number 35)

2. – See, al-Shifa and its commentary Nasim al-Riyad, vol. 3, p. 192.

3. – Al-Du'afa wa al-Matrukun, p. 51.

4. – Mizan al-Itidal, vol. 1, pp. 379–380.

5. – Tahdib al-Tahdib, vol. 1, p. 280.

6. – Ibid, p. 281.

7. – Umda al-Qari, vol. 1, p. 8,

The fourth fabricated tradition is about the excellence of Uthman. This tradition is mentioned by Ibn Majah in his *Sunan*. He narrates from Muhammad bin Abdullah bin Namir and Ali bin Muhammad from Waki'a from Ismael bin Abu Khalid from Qays bin Abu Hazim who quotes Aisha as saying:

As the Holy Prophet (S) fell ill he said: I would like to have one my companions with me.

We said: O Messengers of Allah! Should we bring you Abu Bakr?

The Holy Prophet (S) was silent saying nothing.

We said: Should we bring you Umar?

The Holy Prophet (S) was silent saying nothing.



We said: Should we bring you Uthman?

The Holy Prophet (S) said: Yes

We told Uthman to come and he came and met the Messenger of Allah. As the Holy Prophet was talking to him, Uthman's face was turning pale.

Qays quotes Abu Sahla, Uthman's slave as saying that Uthman bin Affan on Yawm al-Dar said: The Messenger of Allah made a covenant with me and I am going to fulfill it.

Ali bin Muhammad has narrated this tradition in a slightly different manner. According to his version, Uthman says: I will continue to keep that covenant.

Qays says: It was believed that the covenant was the day when Uthman was killed.<sup>1</sup>

Hakim has narrated this tradition on his own documentation from Ismael bin Abu Khalid, from Qays bin Abu Hazim from Abu Sahla (Uthman's slave), from Aisha. He adds that the chain of its transmitters is authentic, though Muslim and Bukhari have not reported it.<sup>2</sup>

## Evaluation of tradition

One of the narrators this chain includes is Qays bin Abu Hazim about whom scholars of tradition have said different things.

Zahabi and Ibn Hajar narrated something from Ya'qub bin Shaiba concerning him. In his *Mizan al-Itidal*, Ibn Hajar says: Companions have talked about Qays. Some have regarded him as great and honorable considering his traditions as the most authentic ones whereas others have criticized him saying that he reported unknown traditions. Those who have praised him have not regarded these traditions as unknown. They have put them in the rank of strange traditions. Others have criticized him saying that he used to criticize Ali (a.s).

It is however clear that he used to prefer Uthman to Ali (a.s) and that is the reason why most Kufis have not reported any tradition from him.<sup>3</sup>

In his *Tadrib al-Rawi*, commenting on him, Suyuti says: Here I want to mention names that were accused of innovation, but Bukhari and Muslim or one of them have however, reported from them. He considers Qays as one of those who were accused of showing hostility towards Ali (a.s).<sup>4</sup>

1. – Sunan Ibn Majah, vol. 1, p. 139 and 130, tradition, no, 113.
2. – Al-Mustadrak als al-Sahihain, vol. 3, p. 106, tradition, no, 4543.
3. – Mizan al-Itidal, vol. 5, p. 476 and Tahdib al-Tahdib, vol. 8, p. 336.
4. – Tadrib al-Rawi, vol. 1, pp. 278 and 279.

The fifth fabricated tradition is reported by Tirmidhi. In his *Sunan* in a chapter on 'excellences of Ma'az bin Jabal, Zaid bin Thabit, Ubai bin Ka'ab and Abu Ubaida bin Jarrah, he narrates a tradition using two different chains of transmitters:

Sufyan bin Waki'a narrates from Hamid bin Abd al-Rahman from Dawood Attar from Mu'ammār from Qutada, from Anas bin Malik who quotes the Holy Prophet (S) as saying:

Abu Bakr is the kindest person, Umar the strictest person in applying divine commandments, Uthman bin Affan the most modest individual, Ma'az bin Jabal the most knowledgeable in divine commands and prohibitions, Zaid bin Thabit the most knowledgeable in inheritance rules and Ubai bin Ka'ab the best reciter of the Holy Quran among my followers. Every community has a trustworthy and the trustworthy of my community is Abu Ubaidah Jarrah.

This is a good but strange tradition which is quoted by no one other than Qutadah. A similar tradition has been reported by Abu Qalaba from Anas bin Malik from the Holy Prophet (S). The tradition reported by Abu Qalaba is more popular.

Muhammad bin Bashshar narrates from Abd al-Wahhab bin Abd al-Majid Thaqafi from Khalid Hazza from Abu Qalaba from Anas bin Malik who quotes the Holy Prophet (S) as saying:

Abu Bakr is the kindest person, Umar the strictest person in applying divine commandments, Uthman bin Affan the most modest individual, Ma'az bin Jabal the most knowledgeable in divine commands and prohibitions, Zaid bin Thabit the most knowledgeable in inheritance rules and Ubai bin Ka'ab the best reciter of the Holy Quran among my followers. Every community has a trustworthy and the trustworthy of my community is Abu Ubaidah Jarrah.

However others have also narrated this narration, among whom is Ibn Majah. He narrated this tradition via two chains of transmitters that are as below:

Muhammad bin Muthanna narrates from Abd al-Wahhab bin Abd al-Majid from Khalid Hazza from Abu Qalaba from Anas bin Malik who quotes the Messenger of Allah (S) as saying:

Abu Bakr is the kindest person, Umar the strictest person in applying divine commandments, Uthman bin Affan the most modest individual, Ma'az bin Jabal the most knowledgeable in divine commands and prohibitions, Zaid bin Thabit the most knowledgeable in inheritance rules and Ubai bin Ka'ab the best reciter of the Holy Quran among my followers. Every community has a trustworthy and the trustworthy of my community is Abu Ubaidah Jarrah.

Like Ibn Qudama, Ali bin Muhammad narrates this tradition from Waki'a from Sufyan from Khalid Hazza from Abu Qalana from Anas bin Malik who quotes the Messenger of Allah (S) as saying:

Abu Bakr is the kindest person, Umar the strictest person in applying divine commandments, Uthman bin Affan the most modest individual, Ma'az bin Jabal the most knowledgeable in divine commands and

prohibitions, Zaid bin Thabit the most knowledgeable in inheritance rules and Ubai bin Ka'ab the best reciter of the Holy Quran among my followers. Every community has a trustworthy and the trustworthy of my community is Abu Ubaidah Jarrah.

Hakim also narrates this tradition saying: Abd al-Rahman bin Hamdan Jallab (from Hamadan), narrates from Abu Hatam Razi from Muhammad bin Yazid bin Sunan Rahawi from Abu Muhammad Kowthar bin Hakim Halabi from Nafi'a from Ibn Umar who quotes the Holy Prophet (S) as saying:

Abu Bakr is the kindest person, Umar the strictest person in applying divine commandments, Uthman bin Affan the most modest individual, Ubai bin Ka'ab the best reciter of the Holy Quran, Zaid bin Thabit the most knowledgeable in inheritance rules, Ali bin Abi Talib the most knowledgeable in judging, Ma'az bin Jabal the most knowledgeable in divine commands and prohibitions, and Abu Zar the most truthful person in my followers. In fact, Abu Ubaidah Jarrah is the trustworthy of my community and the religious scholar of my community is Abdullah bin Abbas. <sup>1</sup>

## **Evaluation of transmitters of tradition**

What we mentioned above were the most important chains in the most authentic Sunni sources. If we mention all chains it will keep us away from the aim of this booklet. We will thus suffice to evaluating a few chains of the transmitters of this tradition.

### **Sufyan bin Waki'a**

The first chain of transmitters of this tradition used by Tirmidhi contains the name of Sufyan bin Waki'a. Scholars of traditions have made certain comments about him.

Bukhari is of the view that scholars are critical of Sufyan due to the warnings they had given to him. Abu Zar'a says he is accused of lying. Ibn Abi Hatam says that when his father was asked about Sufyan he said: He was careless in narrating traditions. Commenting on him, Sufyan says that he is not a trustworthy person. Elsewhere he mentions that Sufyan is not a worthy person. According to Ajuri, Abu Dawood refused to narrate his narrations. Zahabi has considered him as one of those people who were weak in terms of transmitting traditions. According to Ibn Hajar, Sufyan had a writer who would write down what he would dictate. He jotted down things as traditions which were not in reality traditions. When Sufyan was told to change his mind about him, he refused to accept it. Thus his traditions are not authentic.

### **Dawood 'Attar**

Dawood 'Attar is another person the first chain of Tirmidhi includes. Hakim Nayshabur quotes Yahya bin Mu'aen as saying that his traditions are weak. Azdi says that scholars are critical of him. <sup>2</sup>

## **Qutada**

He is another person the first chain of Tirmidhi includes. He was a fatalist and was a propagandist of this school of thought. On the other hand, he was

known as a deceiver. According to Sha'abi, he was mixing authentic and unauthentic traditions together.<sup>3</sup>

## **Muhammad bin Bashshar**

He is among the narrators of the second chain used by Tirmidhi. Fallas has regarded him as a liar. Dawraqi says that he saw Yahya bin Mu'aeen who did not pay attention to him, regarding him as weak in narrating tradition. Qawariri did not like him either. He was the owner of a bath.<sup>4</sup>

## **Abd al-Wahhab bin Abd al-Majid**

He is another person this chain includes. Commenting on him, Ibn Abi Hatam quotes his father as saying: He is an unknown person. Ibn Mahdi places his name among those who narrated traditions from others' books but were not able to keep them. Quoting Ibn Mu'aeen, Dawri says he was suffering from absent-mindedness. According to Abu Dawood he was suffering from sense disruption. On Aqili's view, he was among weak narrators.<sup>5</sup>

## **Khalid Hazza**

He is also among those narrators this chain includes. Concerning him Abu Hatam says the scholars record his traditions but do not act on them. In his *Ta'arih*, 'Aqili quoting Yayha bin Adam through Abu Shahab as saying: Rely on Hajjaj bin Artat and Muhammad bin Ishaq, because they are among the memorizers of tradition. However conceal the traditions reported by Khalid Hazza and Hisham, from me when we are among Basrans. Yahya said that he asked Hammad bin Zaid as to what was the fault of Khalid Hazza. In response he said that he came here from Syria but we do not accept him as a memorizer.

Abbad bin Abbad says that Shu'aba wanted to criticize Khalid but Hammad bin Zaid and I met him and told him not to do so. We threatened him and as a result he was silent. Quoting Ahmad bin Hanbal, 'Aqili says: when one of his traditions was narrated to Ibn Illiyya, he did not pay attention to it and said that he was weak. Ibn Hajar, commenting on their words, says that they made such remarks, because Khalid had lost his memory towards the end of his life or because he had chosen to be an agent of the ruler of his time. <sup>6</sup>

## **Abu Qalaba**

Another reporter of this chain is Abu Qalaba Abdullah bin Zaid Jarmi. He had hostility towards Ali (a.s)

and was impolite towards him. That is why he did not narrate any tradition from him. Moreover, all including those who did not see him, agree that he was a deceitful person. Commenting on him, Abu al-Hasan Qabsi Malik is reported to have said that he was among the jurists of *tabi'a'een* and from the viewpoint of people he was a foolish person.<sup>7</sup>

## Two points

Based on what was mentioned above the chain used by Ibn Majah is not acceptable either. Two points have to be mentioned in regard with the chain of this tradition.

One: This tradition, in addition to having the afore-mentioned flaws, is reported in a *mursal* format. Ibn Hajar and other commentators of *Sahih Bukhari* have mentioned this point. In his commentary, Manavi, quoting Ibn Hajar, says: Tirmidhi and Ibn Hayyan have narrated the full version of this tradition from Khalid Hazza through Abd al-Wahhab Thaqafi. This tradition begins with the word 'kindest' and its chain is authentic. The memorizers of traditions have however said that the starting part of this tradition is *mursal* (broken) and the portion that is *muttasil* (connected) is reported by Bukhari.<sup>8</sup>

Two: The narrator of this tradition is Anas bin Malik who has lied on several occasions. Thus one cannot rely on him.

## Reporters of Hakim's tradition

### Muhammad bin Yazid Rahavi

He is one of the reporters the chain of Hakim includes. Scholars of tradition have criticized him. Dar Qutni says he is weak in transmitting traditions. According to Nisae, he is not strong in narrating traditions. Ibn Hatam quoting his father says that he is not a worthy reporter. He ignores his father. On Bukhari's view, Abu Farwa is *muqarib al-hadith* (mediocre in transmitting traditions), but his son, Muhammad has narrated unknown traditions from him. According to Ajuri as quoted by Abu Dawood, Abu Farwa Jazri was not a valuable reporter. Neither was his son. According to Tirmidhi, his traditions are not reliable and he is weak in narrating tradition. Based on Ibn Hajar's view, he is not strong in terms of narrating traditions.<sup>9</sup> Dahabi has touched his life in *al-Mughni fi al-Du'afa*.<sup>10</sup>

### Kawthar bin Hakim

He is another reporter his chain includes. In *al-Du'afa wa al-Matrukin*, Bukhari says that his traditions are unknown. Nisae also says in the same book that his traditions are rejected. Abu Dar'a, commenting on him says that he is weak. According to Ibn Mu'a'een he is not an important narrator. In Ahmad's point of view, his traditions are false whereas in Dar al-Qutni's opinion his traditions are rejected. In *al-Mughni*, Dahabi Dahabi says that the scholars of tradition have abandoned his traditions which are strange.<sup>11</sup>

Thus it is plain that those who considered his traditions not only weak but also fake and fabricated were right.<sup>12</sup>

1. – Al-Mustadrak al-Sahihain, vol. 3, p. 616, tradition, no. 6281.
2. – Mizan al-Itidal, vol. 3, p. 18 and Tahdib al-Tahdib, vol. 3, p. 173.
3. – Tahdib al-Tahdib, vol. 8, pp. 307–309. See also other Sunni sources.
4. – Mizan al-Itidal, vol. 6, p. 79.
5. – Ibid, vol. 4, p. 434.
6. – Tahdib al-Tahdib, vol. 3, pp. 110 and 111.
7. – Ibid, vol. 5, p. 201 and 202. Mizan al-Itidal, vol. 4, p. 103 and 104.
8. – Fayd al-Qadir, vol. 5, p. 589.
9. – Mizan al-Itidal, vol. 6, p. 372, Tahdib al-Tahdib, vol. 9, p. 452, Taqrib al-Tahdib, vol. 2, p. 174.
10. – Al-Mughni fi al-Du'afa, vol. 2, p. 388.
11. – See the above mentioned works and also al-Mizan, vol. 5, p. 504 and Lisan al-Mizan, vol. 4, pp. 589–590.
12. – Fayz al-Qadir, vol. 1, p. 589.

The sixth fabricated tradition is narrated by Hakim (in his *al-Mustadrak*) in a section on the excellences of Uthman. Based on the standards observed by Bukhari and Muslim, he considers it as authentic. The tradition is as follows:

Abu Ali Hafiz narrates from Abu Bakr Muhammad bin Muhammad bin Sulayman from Abu Ubaidullah Ahmad bin Abd al-Rahman bin Wahab from his uncle from Yahya bin Ayyub from Hisham bin Urwa from his father from Aisha who quotes the Holy Prophet (S) as saying:

To build a mosque, the Holy Prophet (S) positioned the first stone followed by Abu Bakr, Umar and Uthman who positioned the second, third and fourth stones respectively.

I said: O Messenger of Allah! Don't you see how these people help you?

The Holy Prophet (S) said: O Aisha! They are my caliphs and successors.

Commenting on this tradition, Hakim says that this tradition is authentic in accordance with the standards observed by Bukhari and Muslim, though they have not narrated it. The chain of this tradition is weak. It is reported from Muhammad bin Fadl bin 'Atiyya and that is why scholars have not paid attention to it.<sup>1</sup>

## Evaluation of tradition

This tradition is forged and fabricated from the viewpoint of its chain as well as from the perspective of its text.

### 1. Chain of tradition

As for as its chain is concerned, we will suffice to evaluating Ahmad bin Abd al-Rahman bin Wahab

Misri from the viewpoint of the scholars of tradition, ignoring thus the cases of other reporters this chain includes.

According to Ibn Udai all the dignitaries of Egypt regard him as weak in narrating tradition. From the viewpoint of Ibn Yunus one cannot appeal to his tradition to prove anything. According to Ibn Habban he tended to narrate unknown traditions towards the end of his life.<sup>2</sup> It is worth mentioning that Ahmad bin Abd al-Rahman Misri narrated the said tradition from his uncle!

## 2. Text of tradition

To evaluate its text, we will suffice to what Dahabi has said. After quoting Hakim's word, Dahabi says: According to me, Ahmad bin Abd al-Rahman has narrated unknown tradition and is among those due to reporting from whom Muslim is criticized. Yahya, though being reliable, has criticized him. Moreover, if this tradition is authentic it will be a clear proof for the caliphate of Abu Bakr, Umar and Uthman. This tradition is not however an authentic one. This is because at that time, Aisha had not yet married the Holy Prophet (S). She was still a child living in her father's house. Her presence in the chain of this tradition is thus clear evidence that this tradition is false. Quoting Hakim, Dahabi says that this tradition is known to have been reported from Muhammad bin Fadl bin 'Atiyya and that is why scholars do not pay attention to it. Commenting on Hakim's word, Dahabi says that on his view Ibn 'Atiyya is a person who is rejected.<sup>3</sup>

1. – Al-Mustadrak al al-Sahihain, vol. 3, p. 103, tradition, no. 4533.

2. – Mizan al-Itidal, vol. 1, pp. 253 and 254.

3. – Talkhis al-Mustadrak al al-Sahihain, vol. 3, p. 97.

The seventh fabricated tradition is narrated by Abu Dawood. In his *Sunan*, he says: Umar bin Uthman narrated from Muhammad bin Harb from Zubaidi from Ibn Shahab from Amr bin Aban bin Uthman from Jabir bin Abdullah who quotes the Holy Prophet (S) as saying:

Tonight I saw a pious person in my dream. Abu Bakr held to the Messenger of Allah. Umar hang onto Abu Bakr and Uthman onto Umar.

Jabir says when I was leaving the Holy Prophet (S) alone I said to myself that that pious man was the Holy Prophet (S) himself and their hanging onto each other shows that Abu Bakr, Umar and Uthman are supposed to carry out a mission Allah has ordered His Prophet to do.

After narrating this tradition, Abu Dawood says that Yunus and Shu'aib have also narrated this tradition, though they have not mentioned the name of Umar.<sup>1</sup>

Hakim has narrated this tradition from Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Abdullah Saffar from Ahmad bin Mahdi bin Rustam from Musa bin Harun Bardi from Muhammad bin Harb from Zubaidi from Zuhri from

'Amr bin Aban bin Uthman bin Affan from Jabir bin Abdullah who quotes the Holy Prophet (S) as saying:

Tonight I saw a pious person in my dream. Abu Bakr held to the Messenger of Allah. Umar hang onto to Abu Bakr and Uthman to Umar.

Jabir says when I was leaving the Holy Prophet (S) I said to myself that that pious man was the Holy Prophet (S) himself and their hanging onto each other shows that Abu Bakr, Umar and Uthman are supposed to carry out a mission Allah has ordered His Prophet to do.

According to Hakim this tradition being also reported by Abu Huraira, is authentic though Muslim and Bukhari have not narrated it.<sup>2</sup>

## Evaluation of tradition

In his *Talkhis*, Dahabi deals with this tradition as an authentic one, though Hakim seems skeptic about it. He narrates this tradition, using another chain, from Uthman bin Sa'eed Darmi, from Muhammad bin Harb from Sa'eed bin Abdullah Jarjisi from Zubaidi from Zuhri from 'Amr bin Aban bin Uthman from Jabir. Thereupon he says: according to Darmi Yahya bin Mu'aeen believes that the chain of this tradition contains Muhammad bin Harb from whom and Zuhri people narrate mursal traditions. The chain of this tradition includes 'Amr bin Aban whereas Aban bin Uthman did not have a son named 'Amr.<sup>3</sup> Dahabi looks eye to eye with Hakim in this regard.

In order to reject this tradition, we do not need to study the faults Yaqut Hamavi has found in his *Mu'ajam al-Buldan* concerning Muhammad bin Harb and Muhammad bin Walid Zubaidi. According to him, they were from Hams and were known for their hostility toward Ali (a.s). According to the author of *Tahdib al-Tahdib* they were among the judges of the oppressive government of their time in Egypt. Ibn Shahab Zuhri was among the well-known opponents of Ali (a.s). All these objections aside, to reject this tradition we suffice to what Abu Dawood and Yahya bin Mu'aeen have said.

It has to be pinpointed that nothing came to our mind to iron out the apparent contradiction that exists between Hakim and Zahabi's words.

1. – Sunan Abu Dawood, vol. 3, pp. 213 –214, tradition, no. 4636.

2. – Al-Mustadrak ala al-Sahihain, tradition, no. 4439.

3. – Ibid, vol. 3, p. 109, tradition, no. 4551.

The eighth fabricated tradition is narrated by Tabarani. He narrates from Ma'az bin Jabal who quotes the Holy Prophet (S) as saying:

I saw in a dream that I was on one pan of scale and my community was on the other. I equaled my entire community. Thereupon Abu Bakr was on one pan of scale and my community on the other. Abu



Bakr equaled all of them. Then Umar was on one pan of scale and my community on the other. Umar equaled all of them. Uthman was also on one pan of scale and my community was on the other. Uthman equaled all of them. Thereupon the scale was removed.

Haythami and Muttaqi Hindi have narrated this tradition from Tabarani. 1

## **'Amr bin Waqid as one of the reporters of this tradition**

After quoting this tradition, Haythami says that 'Amr bin Waqid is one of the reporters of this tradition. 'Amr is a rejected person. All scholars have considered him as weak. Here are some of the comments made by Sunni scholars concerning Amr.

Quoting Abu Mushir, Yazid bin Muhammad bin Abd al-Samad says that he used to lie unintentionally. Quoting Dahim, Ya'aqub bin Sufyan says that great Sunni scholars do not narrate traditions from him. According to Ya'aqub Dahim was not skeptic that 'Amr was a liar. According to Bukhari and Tirmidhi he used to narrate unknown traditions.

In Abu Hatam's point of view, he is weak, reporting unknown traditions. Nisae, Dar Qutni and Barqani say that his traditions are rejected. 2

In his *Mizan al-Itidal*, Dahabi puts him in the rank of those narrators from whom Tirmidhi and Ibn Majah report. He rebukes him and mentions some of his fabricated traditions among which is the tradition under question. According to him such traditions have got popularity through people like Amr who is not reliable. 3

## **Caliphs and Divine Order**

The ninth tradition on the excellences of caliphs and the order of their caliphate is narrated by Muttaqi Hindi. He narrates it from Ibn Asakir and Ibn Udai from Ibn Umar who quote the Holy Prophet (S) as saying:

Allah ordered me to love four ones from among my companions. I love Abu Bakr, Umar, Uthman and Ali.

After quoting this tradition, Muttaqi Hindi says that one of the reporters of this tradition is Sulayman bin Isa bin Najih. Commenting on him, Ibn Udai says that he fabricates tradition. 4

## **Sulayman bin Isa Sajzi is among the reporters of this Tradition**

Here are the views of some the scholars of tradition concerning him:

According to Dahabi, he used to narrate the traditions of Malik through Ibn 'Awn and other reporters. In Juzjani's point of view, he is known for telling lie. Abu Hatam is also of the view that he is a liar.

According to Ibn Udai he used to fabricate traditions. He, according to him, wrote his *Tafdil al-Aql* in two volumes.

Among other baseless traditions, he narrates one from Laith, from Nafi'a, from Ibn Umar using a marfu'a format. According to him, the Holy Prophet (S) said:

Allah ordered me to love four ones; Abu Bakr, Umar, Uthman and Ali.<sup>5</sup>

It has to be pointed out that Ibn Hajar has also touched these issues.<sup>6</sup>

1. – Majma'a al-Zawaed, vol. 9, p. 51 and Kanz al-Ummal, vol. 11, p. 296.
2. – Tahdib al-Tahdib, vol. 8, p. 97.
3. – Mizan al-Itidal, vol. 5, pp. 349–351.
4. – Kanz al-Ummal, vol. 1, p.293, tradition no. 33099.
5. – Mizan al-Itidal, vol. 3, p. 308.
6. – Lisan al-Mizan, vol. 3, p. 113.

The tenth tradition on the excellences of caliphs and the order their caliphate is narrated by Suyuti. In his *al-Khasaes*, he mentions: Ibn Abi Khathima (in his history), Abu Ya'ala, Bazzaz and Abu Na'aeem have quoted Anas as saying:

One day I was with the Holy Prophet in a garden. Someone knocked at the gate. The Holy Prophet (S) ordered me to get up and open the gate for him and give him the glad tiding of Paradise and caliphate after me. I opened the gate and it was Abu Bakr. Thereupon another person knocked at the gate. The Holy Prophet (S) ordered me to get up and open the gate for him and give him the glad tiding of Paradise and caliphate after Abu Bakr. I opened the gate and it was Umar. Thereupon another man knocked at the gate. The Holy Prophet (S) ordered me to get up and open the gate for him and give him the glad tiding of Paradise and caliphate after Umar and tell him that he would be killed. I opened the gate and it was Uthman.<sup>1</sup>

## **Fabricated tradition from the viewpoint of Khatib Baghdadi**

Saqar bin Abd al-Rahman bin Bint Malik bin Mughul – he was from Kufa. Known as Abu Behz he lived in Baghdad. He narrated traditions– told me: Ali bin Muhammad bin Hasan Maliki narrated from Abdullah bin Uthman Saffar from Muhammad bin Imran bin Musa Sayrafi from Abdullah bin Ali Madini who told me he had talked about Abu Behz's tradition – which he had narrated from Ibn Idris from Mukhtar bin Filfil from Anas – with his father and told him this tradition is similar to Abu Musa's.

My father said that this tradition was fabricated. Thereupon Khatib narrates it through his own chain from Abu Ya'ala, which is as under:

Abu Behz bin Abd al-Rahman bin Bint Malik bin Mughul narrates from Abdullah bin Idris from Mukhtar

bin Filfil from Anas bin Malik who quotes the Holy Prophet (S) as saying:

One day I was with the Holy Prophet in a garden. Someone knocked at the gate. The Holy Prophet (S) ordered me to get up and open the gate for him and give him the glad tiding of Paradise and caliphate after me. I opened the gate and it was Abu Bakr. Thereupon another person knocked at the gate. The Holy Prophet (S) ordered me to get up and open the gate for him and give him the glad tiding of Paradise and caliphate after Abu Bakr. I opened the gate and it was Umar. Thereupon another man knocked at the gate. The Holy Prophet (S) ordered me to get up and open the gate for him and give him the glad tiding of Paradise and caliphate after Umar and tell him that he would be killed. I opened the gate and it was Uthman.

Abd al-Mu'amin says that he asked Abu Ali about his opinion regarding Saqar, he said that Saqar was a simple teacher to whom no one paid attention in Baghdad. He used to fabricate traditions. Abu Ali goes on saying that Salih bin Muhammad is among the most lying people and his son Abu Hez excels his father in lying.<sup>2</sup>

It has to be mentioned that Aini has also narrated this tradition in his commentary on *Sahih Bukhari* saying that Abu Ya'ala Musili has narrated it as one of the traditions of Mukhtar bin Filfil from Anas. According to him, it is a hasan (good) tradition.<sup>3</sup>

## Other opinions

As mentioned above, some of the Sunni memorizers have considered Abu Behz as a liar and regarded this tradition of his as fabricated. Ibn Udai says that whenever he narrated a tradition from him, Abu Ya'ala would point out that it was weak. Dahabi is also among those who deem this tradition as fabricated. After giving an account of Saqar's life, he, in his *Mizan*, says that Saqar bin Abd al-Rahman known as Abu Behz, was the grandson of Malik bin Mughul. He narrates this false tradition from Abdullah bin Idris from Mukhtar bin Filfil from Anas who quotes the Holy Prophet (S) as saying: O Anas! Get up, open the gate and give him the glad tiding of Paradise and caliphate after me....!

This tradition mentions the same thing about Umar and Uthman. Zahabi says according to Ibn Udai Abu Ya'ala considered him as weak whenever he narrated a tradition from him.

In Abu Bakr's point of view, he used to fabricate traditions. According to Abu Ali he was lying very much.<sup>4</sup> In his *Lisan al-Mizan*, Ibn Hajar has followed Dahabi, after mentioning his words. He narrates the said tradition using his own chain from Abu Ya'ala from Saqar bin Abdullah bin Idris from Mukhtar bin Filfil from Anas. According to him, if this tradition were authentic, Umar would not leave the matter of caliphate to council and would introduce Uthman as the next caliph.<sup>5</sup>

1. – Al-Khasaes al-Kubra, vol. 2, p. 438.

2. – Tarikh Baghdad, vol. 9, pp. 340 and 341.

3. – Umda al-Qari, vol. 16, pp. 176 –177.

4. – Mizan al-Itidal, vol. 3, pp. 434 and 435.

5. – Lisan al-Mizan, vol. 3, pp. 227 and 228.

The eleventh tradition is reported by three Sunni scholars, Abd al-Wahhabi Kilabi (d. 396 AH) in his *Musnad*<sup>1</sup>, Ibn Asakir in his *Tarikh Medina Demishq* and Khatib Baghdadadi in his *T'arikh Baghdad*.

Khatib Baghdadadi narrates this tradition from Abd al-Wahhab bin Hasan Demishqi from Abu al-Qasim Abdullah bin Ahmad bin Muhammad Tamimi Mu'allim – known as Ghabaghabi – from Dirar bin Sahl Dirari from Hasan bin 'Arafa from Abu Hafs Abbar Umar bin Abd al-Rahman from Hamid from Anas, from Ali bin Abi Talib who quotes the Holy Prophet (S) saying:

O Ali! Allah has ordered me to choose Abu Bakr as my father, Umar as my advisor, Uthman as my backer and you – Ali –as my supporter...

After narrating this tradition, Khatib says that this tradition is utterly unknown and only two unknown reporters named Dirar bin Sahl and Ghabaghabi – quoting Dirar bin Sahl – have report it using the said chain.<sup>2</sup>

In his *al-Ma'wdu'at*, Ibn Jawzi narrates some traditions on the virtues of caliphs. The first tradition he mentions is this tradition which is as follows:

Abu Mansur narrates from Abu Bakr Ahmad bin Ali Khatib from Abd al-Wahhab bin Hasan Demishqi from Abu al-Qasim Abdullah bin Ahmad bin Muhammad Tamimi – known as Ghabaghabi – from Dirar bin Sahl from Hasan bin 'Arafa from Abu Hafs Abbar from Hamid from Anas...

After narrating this tradition, he quotes Khatib as saying: This tradition is utterly unknown and only two unknown reporters named Dirar bin Sahl and Ghabaghabi – quoting Dirar bin Sahl – have reported it using the said chain.<sup>3</sup>

According to Dahabi Dirar bin Sahl narrates false traditions from Hasan bin Arafa. He says he does not know who this creature is! This tradition is also narrated by Ibn 'Arafa.

Abbar narrates from Hamid from Anas from Ali (S) who quotes the Holy Prophet (S) as saying:

O Ali! Allah ordered me to choose Abu Bakr as my father.

This tradition is reported by Akhu Tabuk Abd al-Wahhab Kilabi from Abdullah bin Ahmad Ghabaghabi – one of the two unknown reporters – from Dirar.<sup>4</sup> It has to be mentioned here that Ibn Hajar has also narrated this opinion of Dahabi.<sup>5</sup>

## Evaluation of tradition

It has become thus far clear that the said tradition is among the fabricated traditions. Like Dahabi, Ibn Hajar, after quoting the said tradition, says: Akhu Tabuk Abd al-Wahhab Kilabi has narrated this tradition from Abdullah bin Ahmad Ghabaghabi.

After introducing Ghabaghabi as one of the two unknown reporters as did Dahabi, Ibn Hajar, commenting on Abdullah bin Ahmad bin Muhammad Tamimi known as Aba'abi, says: Aba'abi has narrated a tradition on the virtues of caliphs from Dirar bin Sahl through Hasan bin Arafa. Abd al-Wahhab Alaei has however also narrated this tradition from Aba'abi.

You see that Ibn Hajar mentions first 'Ghabaghabi' and then 'Aba'abi'! At one time he introduces Abd al-Wahhab 'Kilabi as the reporter and at another time Abd al-Wahhab 'Alaei!

Ibn Hajar quotes Khatib as saying: This is an utterly unknown tradition. No one other than Dirar has narrated this tradition using the said chain. Both Dirar and Aba'abi are unknown. According to Ibn Asakir he is from the race of Faras bin Habis Tamimi, brother of 'Aqra' bin Habis. 'Aba'abi was a teacher at al-Jasiyya in Damascus and died in 425 AH.

According to Ibn Hajar, 'Aba'abi was a popular reporter whereas there are doubts concerning Dirar.<sup>6</sup>

## A critique of Ibn Hajar's opinion

Based on what was said though Ibn Hajar is skeptic about the title of 'Aba'abi and his reporter (Abd al-Wahhab), he tries to introduce 'Aba'abi as a popular person. It has however to said that he is not successful in his endeavor. This is because to prove that he was popular he did not present any document. The fact that he was a teacher at a certain location and died in such and such year does not solve the problem. Otherwise, Dahabi, Khatib Baghdadadi – who narrates from him through one medium –, Ibn Jawzi – who narrates from Khatib through one medium– would not have introduced him as unknown!

1. – It has to mentioned that Musnad Abd al-Wahhab Kilabi contains Musnad Demishq.
2. – Tarikah Baghdad, vol. 9, p. 348.
3. – Al-Mawdu'at, vol. 1, pp. 301 and 302.
4. – Mizan al-Itidal, vol. 1, pp. 301 and 302.
5. – Lisan al-Mizan, vol. 3, pp. 238 and 239.
6. = Ibid, p. 250.

The twelfth tradition on the excellences of caliphs and the order of their caliphate is narrated by Timidhi. He quotes Imam Ali (a.s) as saying:

May Allah bless Abu Bakr. He married me his daughter. He advised me to migrate to Medina and he freed Bilal through his own wealth. No one's wealth has been so helpful to me for the promotion of Islam as Abu Bakr's.

May Allah bless Umar who speaks the truth even though it be bitter. Truth left him alone but did not find any other friend.

May Allah bless Uthman whom angels did not face out of modesty. He equipped Jaish al-Usra<sup>1</sup> and he expanded our mosque to the extent it accommodated us.

May Allah bless Ali! O Allah! Make truth accompany him wherever he goes.<sup>2</sup>

Jalal al-Din Suyuti narrated this tradition from Tirmidhi and considered it as authentic.<sup>3</sup>

## **Mukhtar bin Nafi'a**

Among the reporters of this tradition is Mukhtar bin Nafi'a who is rejected by the scholars of tradition. According to Abu Zar'a, his narrations are weak. According to Bukhari, Nisae and Abu Hatam his traditions are unknown. Based on what Nisae has said elsewhere, he is not a reliable person. In Ibn Hayyan's point of view, he used to narrate unknown traditions from well-known people. It seems as if he was doing it intentionally.

According to Abu Ahmad Hakim, scholars are of the view that he is not reliable in narrating tradition. Saji is of the view that his traditions are unknown.<sup>4</sup>

Based on what was mentioned above, memorizers of traditions have considered this tradition among false ones. For example, Ibn Jawzi first relates this tradition through Mukhar and then says: This tradition owes its reputation to the name 'Mukhtar'. According to Bukhari he narrates unknown traditions. Based on Ibn Hayyan's opinion, he narrated unknown traditions from well-known people to the extent that it was thought that he was doing it purposely.<sup>5</sup> According to Dahabi, he narrated tradition from Abu Hayyan Tamimi. On the basis of the opinions of Nisae and others, he is not a credible reporter. According to Ibn Hayyan his traditions are extremely unknown. Ahmad bin Abd al-Rahman Kazbarani says that Mukhtar narrated this tradition from his father from Ali (a.s) in marfu'a format. Bukahri is of the view that his traditions are unknown and his nickname is Abu Ishaq.<sup>6</sup>

Manawi says: The author has implied that this tradition is authentic but his opinion is not correct. This is because Ibn Jawzi has considered this tradition among weak ones. This tradition owes its reputation to the name 'Mukhtar'. According to Ibn Hayyan, Mukhatar narrates unknown traditions from well-known people to the extent that it was thought that he was doing it purposely.

*Mizan al-Itidal* on the other hand mentions that his traditions are unknown. The author of *Mizan* places this tradition among unknown traditions reported by Mukhtar.<sup>7</sup>

1. – The army that was dispatched to Tabuk is called Jaish al–Usra. This is because this army was dispatched at a time of prevalence of famine, drought and scarcity of food.
2. – Sunan Ibn Majah, vol. 5, p. 297, tradition, no. 3798.
3. – Al–Jami'a al–Saghir, vol. 2, p. 9, tradition, no. 4412.
4. – Tahdib al–Tahdib, vol. 10, p. 63.
5. – Al–Ilal al–Mutanahiya, vol. 1, pp. 255 and 256.
6. – Mizan al–Itidal, vol. 6, p. 386.
7. – Fayz al–Qadir, vol. 4, p. 25.

The thirteenth tradition on the excellences of caliphs and the order of their caliphate is reported by Tabarani, Abu Na'aeem Isfahani, Ibn Udai, Khatib Baghdadadi and other Sunni scholars. They have reported this tradition from Ibn Abbas.

Khatib Baghdadadi narrates from Ibn Abbas who quotes the Holy Prophet (S) as saying:

It is written on each leaf of Paradise trees that Muhammad is the Messenger of Allah, Abu Bakr is truthful, Umar is the distinguisher between truth and falsehood and Uthman is the owner of two lights.<sup>1</sup>

## **Scholars and fabricated tradition**

In section devoted to the excellences of Abu Bakr, Umar and Uthman, Ibn Jawzi has narrated a few traditions. The first tradition of this section is narrated from Abd al–Rahman bin Muhammad Qazzar, from Ahmad bin Ali bin Thabit from Qazi Abu al–Faraj Muhammad bin Ahmad bin Hasan Shafi'ai ... from Mujaheed from Ibn Abbas who quotes the Holy Prophet (S) as saying:

It is written on each leaf of Paradise trees that Muhammad is the Messenger of Allah, Abu Bakr is truthful, Umar is the distinguisher between truth and falsehood and Uthman is the owner of two lights.

Commenting on this tradition, Abu Hatam says that this tradition is false and fabricated. Ali bin Jamil used to fabricate traditions. It is by no means permissible to narrate from him.

According to Abu Ahmad bin Udai no one other than Ali bin Jamil has narrated this tradition from Jarir. It is he who narrated false traditions from reliable narrators. He is thus a stealer of traditions.<sup>2</sup> Based on Dahabi's point of view, he narrates from Jarir bin Abd al–Hamid and Isa bin Musa. Ibn Hayyan rejects him and Dar Qutni and others regard him as weak in narrating traditions. Ali bin Jamil narrates from Jarir from Mujahid from Ibn Abbas who quotes the Holy Prophet (S) as saying: During the Mi'araj, when I was ascended to Heaven .....

An unknown master named 'Ma'aruf bin Abi Ma'aruf Balkhi has narrated this tradition like Ali bin Jamil from Jarir.<sup>3</sup>

Commenting on this tradition and its reporter, Suyuti says: Tabarani narrates from Sa'eed bin Abd

Rabbah Saffar Baghdadi from Ali bin Jamil Ruqqi from Jarir bin Abd al-Majid from Laith from Mujaheed (in a marfu'a format) from Ibn Abbas who quotes the Holy Prophet (S) as saying:

There is no tree in Paradise except that its leaves bear ....

According to Ibn Hayyan this tradition is fabricated by Ali bin Jamil. Suyuti says that Abu Na'aeem Isfahani has narrated this tradition in his al-Hilliya, from Qazi Abu Ahmad bin Muhammad from Ahmad bin Hasan bin Abd al-Malik from Ali bin Jamil.

In his *al-Dibaj*, Khatli says that Qasim bin Ali Kufi has narrated this tradition in a marfu'a format from Abd al-Aziz bin Amr Khurasani from Jarir Razi from Laith from Mujaheed from Ibn Abbas.

According to Dahabi in his al-Mizan, Abd al-Aziz is an unknown figure and this tradition is false. This is the fault that lies with this tradition.

In Ibn Udai's point of view, Ahmad bin Amir Barqi'adi has narrated this tradition using a marfu'a format from Ma'aruf Balkhi in Damascus, from Jarir, from Laith, from Mujahid from Ibn Abbas.

Dahabi remarks that this tradition is forged and fabricated.<sup>4</sup>

1. – Ta'arikh Baghdad, vol. 5, p. 207.
2. – Al-Mawdu'at, vol. 1, p. 251.
3. – Mizan al-itidal, vol. 5, p. 144.
4. – Al-Lu'ali al-Masnu'a, vol. 1, pp. 292 and 293.

The fourteenth tradition on the excellences of caliphs and the order of their caliphate is reported by a group memorizers of tradition.

Ibn Jawzid narrates the second of his traditions from Hibatullah bin Muahmmad bin Hasin from Abu Talib bin Ghaylan from Abu Bakr Sha'afi'a from Muhammad bin Uthman bin Abi Shaiba from Hasan bin Salih from Hasan bin Hasan Narsi from Asba'a bin Faraj from Bai'a bin Muhammad from Abu Sulayman lili from Ibn Jarir from Amr bin Dinar from Ibn Abbas who quotes the Holy Prophet (S) as saying:

When there is the Day of Judgment, a caller calls from beneath the Arsh saying: Where are the companions of Muhammad? It is at this moment that Abu Bakr, Umar, Uthman and Ali are brought. Abu Bakr is told to stand at the gate of Paradise and let anyone he pleases enter Paradise through the mercy of Allah and not to let anyone he pleases enter Paradise through the knowledge of Allah!

Umar is told to control the scale increasing the weight of the pan of anyone he pleases through the mercy of Allah and decreasing the weight of the pan of anyone he please with Allah's knowledge!

The Holy Prophet goes on saying: Two sumptuous dresses are prepared for Uthman bin Affan and he is told to wear them for [Allah] has saved them for him as He was creating the heaven and the earth.



Ali bin Abi Talib is given a rod from Usaj, a tree created by Allah in Paradise and he is told to disperse through it the people from around the pool!

Ibn Jawzi says that Isba'a has narrated this tradition from Sulayman bin Abd al-'Ala from Ibn Jarir. Similarly, according to him, Isba'a has narrated this tradition from Sari bin Muhammad from Abu Sulayman lili from Ibn Jarir. This shows that Isba'a or other narrators of this tradition are talking nonsensical things. The chain of this tradition contains some unknown names.

Ahmad bin Hasan Kufi has narrated this tradition from Waki'a who according to Dar Qutni is rejected. According to Ibn Hayyan he narrates fabricated traditions from reliable persons.

Ibrahim bin Abdullah Masisi has also narrated this tradition from Hajjaj bin Muhammad from Ibn Jarir. On Ibn Hayyan's view, Ibrahim used to steal traditions and change them. According to him, he used to narrate traditions from reliable people, which were not part their traditions. Thus on his view, Ibrahim is to be placed among people whose traditions are rejected.<sup>1</sup>

## **Fabricated tradition and Dahabi and Asqalani**

After mentioning the name of Ibrahim bin Abdullah in his Mizan, Dahabi gives an account of his life. While elaborating on his life, he touches two traditions –one of which we mentioned above– saying that on his view he is a liar. Hakim says that his traditions are forged and fabricated.

Hakim narrates in a marfu'a format from Ibrahim from Waki'a from Sufyan from Amr bin Dinar from Ibn Abbas who quotes the Holy Prophet (S) as saying: when there is the Day of Judgment Abu Bakr will be at one of the pillar of the pool, Umar at the second pillar, Uthman at the third pillar

and Ali at the fourth. Anyone who is hostile towards anyone of them will not be given water to drink.

Ibrahim narrates in a marfu'a format from Hajjaj from Ibn Jarir from Amr bin Dinar from Ibn Abbas who quotes the Holy Prophet as saying:

When there is the Day of Judgment, a caller calls from beneath the Arsh saying: Where are the companions of Muhammad? It is at this moment that Abu Bakr, Umar, Uthman and Ali are brought. Abu Bakr is told to stand at the gate of Paradise and let in anyone he pleasesthrough the mercy of Allah and not to let in anyone he pleasesthrough the knowledge of Allah!<sup>2</sup>

In his *Lisan*, Ibn Hajar follows in the footsteps of Dahabi. While giving an account of his life, he refers the said two traditions and says that Ibrahim bin Abdullah is a liar.<sup>3</sup>

1. – Al-Mawdu'at, vol. 1, pp. 302 and 303.

2. – Mizan al-Itidal, vo. 1, pp. 160 and 161.

3. – Lisan al-Mizan, vol. 1, p. 169.

The aforementioned traditions were but a small part of numerous fabricated traditions on the excellences of caliphs. Some Sunni scholars have mentioned part of these fabricated traditions in their books on fabricated traditions. These books include among others *al-Mawdu'at* by Ibn Jawzi, *al-Kamil* by Ibn Udai, *Mizan al-Itidal* by Dahabi, *al-Lu'ali al-Masnu'a* by Jalal al-Din al-Suyuti, *Lisan al-Mizan* by Ibn Hajar and *Tanzih al-Shari'a* by Ibn 'Arraq.

Despite all these, the said scholars refuse to admit that the traditions available in Sihah Sitta, specially *Sahih Bukhari* and *Sahih Muslim* are fabricated. This is because these two books have a high status in their eyes.

In our researches, we have studied part of the traditions of *Sahih Bukhari* and *Sahih Muslim* with the aim to show that these two books, like every other book, contain authentic and unauthentic traditions. In our previous works that are even published, we have dealt with this issue in a rather detailed manner. We thank Allah because of doing all this.

These traditions are however false and fabricated and their mention in *Sahih Bukhari* or *Sahih Muslim* does not change anything.

The aim of the fabricators of these traditions is not something that is veiled from the viewpoint of scholars. The Sunni scholars who support caliphate know very well about what happened after the demise of the Holy Prophet (S). They also know that Allah has not provided them with any reason to prove their point of view. That is why they deem it necessary in the past and they feel it is necessary to day to justify the issue of caliphate [on the basis of something that is related to revelation]. But no one can amend [overnight] what time has corrupted in ages!

### **May Allah bless Muhammad and his progeny!**

1. Ghazzali, *Ihya ulum al-din*, Beirut, Dar al-Ma'arifa.
2. Ibn Abd al-Barr, *Al-Isti'ab fi Ma'arifat al-Ashab*, Ibn Abd al-Barr, Beirut, Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyya, first edition, 1415 AH.
3. Khatib Baghdadi, *Tarikh Baghdadi*, Beirut, Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyya, first edition, 1417 AH.
4. Ibn Shu'aba al-Harrani, *Tuhaf al-Uqul*, Qom, Mu'assisa Nashr al-Islami, fourth edition, 1416 AH.
5. Jalal al-Din al-Suyuti, *Tadrib al-Rawi*, Beirut, Dar al-Kitab al-Arabi, 1414 AH.
6. Ibn Hajar Asqalani, *Taqrib al-Tahdib*, Beirut, Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyya, second edition, 1415 AH.
7. Dahabi, *Talkhis al-Mustadrak al al-Sahihain*, Beirut, Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyya, 1415 AH.

8. Ibn Hajar al-'Asqalani, *Tahdib al-Tahdib*, Beirut, Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyya, 1415 AH.
9. Jalal al-Din al-Suyuti, *al-Jami'a al-Saghir*, Beirut, Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyya, 1410 AH.
10. Nisae, *al-Khasaees*, Qom, Majma'a Ihya al-Thaqafa al-Islamiyya, 1419 AH.
11. Ibn Majah, *Sunan*, Beirut, Dar al-Jil, first edition, 1418 AH.
12. Abu Dawood, *Sunan*, Beirut, Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyya, first edition, 1416 AH.
13. Timidhi, *Sunan*, Beirut, Dar al-Fikr, second edition, 1403 AH.
14. Ibn Abi al-Hadid, *Sharh Nahj al-Balagha*, Beirut, Dar Ihya al-Turath al-Arabi, second edition, 1387.
15. Qazi Ayaz, *al-Shifa be Ta'arif Huquq al-Mustafa*, Beirut, Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyya.
16. Bukhari, Sahih, Beirut, *Dar Ibn Kathir*, fifth edition, 1414 AH.
17. Muslim, Sahih, Beirut, *Dar al-Fikr*, first edition, 1407 AH.
18. Ahmand bin Shu'aib Nisae, *al-Du'afa wa al-Matrukun*, Beirut, Dar al-Ilm.
19. Ibn Jawzi, al-Ilal al-Mutanahiya fi al-Ahadith al-Wahiyya, Beirut, first edition, 1403.
20. Badr al-Din Aini, *Umada al-Qari*, Beirut, Dar al-Fikr.
21. Muhammad bin Abd Rauf Manawi, *Fayz al-Qadir*, Beirut, Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyya, first edition, 1415 AH.
22. Dahabi, al-Kashif an Asma Rijal al-Kutub al-Sitta, Beirut, Dar al-Fikr, 1418 AH.
23. Muttaqi Hindi, *Kanz al-Ummal*, Beirut, Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyya, first edition, 1419 AH.
24. Suyuti, *Al-Lu'ali al-Masnu'a fi al-Ahadith al-Mawdu'a*, Beirut, Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyya. 1417 AH.
25. Ibn Hajar, *Lisan al-Mizan*, Beirut, Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyya, first edition, 1416 AH.
26. Haithami, *Majma'a al-Zawaed*, Beirut, Dar al-Fikr, 1412 AH.
27. Hakim, *al-Mustadrak al-Sahihain*, Beirut, Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyya, first edition, 1411 AH.
28. Dahabi, *al-Mughni fi al-Du'afa*, Beirut, Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyya, first edition, 1418 AH.
29. Ibn Jawzi *al-Mawdu'at*, Beirut, Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyya, first edition, 1415.
30. Dahabi, *Mizan al-Itidal*, Beirut, Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyya, 1416 AH.

31. Shahab al-Din Hafahi, *Nasim al-Riyad fi Sharh Shifa al-Qazi Ayaz*, Beirut, Dar al-Fikr.
32. Shams al-Din Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Khallakan, *Wafayat al-A'ayan*, Beirut, Dar Sadir.
- 

**Source URL:** <https://www.al-islam.org/fabricated-traditions-sayyid-ali-al-husayni-al-milani>

### Links

- [1] <https://www.al-islam.org/user/login?destination=node/40406%23comment-form>
- [2] <https://www.al-islam.org/user/register?destination=node/40406%23comment-form>
- [3] <https://www.al-islam.org/person/sayyid-ali-al-husayni-al-milani>
- [4] <https://www.al-islam.org/person/dr-sayyid-abdur-rauf-afzali>
- [5] <https://www.al-islam.org/library/sunni-shia>
- [6] <https://www.al-islam.org/library/early-islamic-history>
- [7] <https://www.al-islam.org/library/hadith-collections>
- [8] <https://www.al-islam.org/tags/caliphate>
- [9] <https://www.al-islam.org/tags/fabricated-traditions>
- [10] <https://www.al-islam.org/feature/debates-discussions>
- [11] <https://www.al-islam.org/feature/resources-further-research>
- [12] <https://www.al-islam.org/feature/responses-misconceptions>
- [13] <https://www.al-islam.org/person/umar-b-al-khattab>
- [14] <https://www.al-islam.org/person/abu-bakr>
- [15] <https://www.al-islam.org/person/uthman>
- [16] <https://www.al-islam.org/person/imam-ali>